

THE ORIGINS AND ORGANIZATIONAL DEVELOPMENTS OF
THE PENTECOSTAL MISSIONARY ENTERPRISE IN CHINA

R. G. Tiedemann

We have taken for granted an obscure history of Pentecostalism for so long that the multitudes of nameless people responsible for its grassroots expansion have passed into history unremembered and their memory is now very difficult to retrieve.

*Allan Anderson*¹

The Pentecostal movement owes its inspiration and formation to the emergence of radical evangelical currents during the second half of the nineteenth century. These new religious movements were significantly different in their eschatological expectations and missionary methods and began to severely challenge mainstream Protestantism in Europe and North America. Several innovative theological currents had a decisive influence on the formation of a host of new denominations and new missionary bodies. Holiness Wesleyans, higher life fundamentalists, the ascendancy of premillennialism, including its dispensationalist variant, restorationist currents, sabbatarian ideas, as well as diverse strands of German and Scandinavian Pietism all contributed to forge the new Evangelicalism as a protest against the growing ‘worldliness’ of the ‘mainline’ Protestant denominations in Western countries.²

¹ Allan Anderson, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004), p. 175.

² See Melvin Easterday Dieter, *The Holiness Revival of the Nineteenth Century*, 2nd ed. (Lanham, Md.: Scarecrow Press, 1996). For a brief background discussion and the relevant literature, see Allan Anderson, *Spreading Fires: The Missionary Nature of Early Pentecostalism* (London: SCM Press, 2007),

The Holiness leaders, for example, rejected the optimistic postmillennial convictions of mainline Protestantism. Instead, they insisted that the world was about to come to an apocalyptic conclusion, ushering in the imminent Second Coming of Christ *prior* to the establishment of his millennial kingdom on earth. In spite of their essentially pessimistic worldview, premillennialists were enthusiastic supporters of evangelical foreign missions.³ Because of their belief in Christ's imminent return, a greater sense of urgency characterized the work of these missions. Convinced that the worldwide preaching of the gospel to every human being could accelerate the coming of Christ, relatively little attention was paid to setting up educational or medical facilities.⁴

After 1900, Protestant Christianity in China became even more diverse than it had been in the late nineteenth century. In a climate of heightened revivalist expectations, many new mission groups were seeking access to that vast country. Some of these were unconnected with any denominational church, but established solely to send missionaries to China and other countries targeted for evangelization. In this connection, the South Chihli Mission serves as an example of the readiness of individuals to spread the Gospel in China. The initial attempt by the Congregational clergyman Horace William Houlding (1861-1922) to set up this undenominational 'faith' mission failed because of the destructive Boxer Uprising of 1900. A year later, Houlding returned from the United States with a party of fourteen missionaries, representing seven diverse denominational affiliations, and re-started the mission in the southern part of Zhili (now called Hebei) province. Several separate works would in due course develop

especially Chapter 2: "In All its Pristine Power: Precursors and Context". The European dimension has been considered in David Bundy, *Visions of Apostolic Mission: Scandinavian Pentecostal Mission to 1935* (Uppsala: Uppsala University Library, 2009), Chapter 2: "Cultural Space: The Historical and Theoretical Background of Scandinavian Pentecostal Mission in Pietist, Methodist, Baptist and Holiness Sources".

³ Timothy P. Weber, *Living in the Shadow of the Second Coming*, enlarged ed. (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Academie Books, 1983), pp. 66-67.

⁴ However, as Dana Robert has pointed out, female missionaries, in particular, would nevertheless "undertake ministries of compassion" in the face of poverty and hunger in the mission countries. Dana Robert, *American Women in Mission: A Social History of Their Thought and Practice* (Macon: Mercer University Press, 1996), pp. xviii-xix.

from the South Chihli Mission, notably the China Mennonite Mission Society (also known as the German Mennonite Mission, U.S.A.) in southwestern Shandong and adjacent districts of Henan (1905), the Ebenezer Mission at Miyang in Henan province (1907), and the National Holiness Association in western Shandong (1910).⁵

It is not only the proliferation of new small missionary enterprises that poses a significant problem to scholars studying Protestant Christianity in China. The arrival in significant numbers of various independent or ‘faith’ missionaries, including Pentecostal evangelists, has aggravated the issue. While in some instances Pentecostal influences are evident, in other cases the spiritual affiliation of an individual or group is impossible to determine. Much remains obscure. Indeed, in a number of cases it has proved impossible to find any information – except for the listing of the mission’s name in the relevant Protestant directories.⁶ Many of them had no organizational backing at all, but came to China entirely on their own, often leading precarious existences on account of inadequate resources. Some were not able to cope with the hardships and cultural adjustments and returned home after a short time.⁷

With regard to the early the Pentecostal movement in China, the insistence on independence and autonomy of a great variety of local fellowships back home has resulted in a paucity of documentary evidence. In contrast to the ‘mainline’ missionary societies, with their often rich archival resources, the absence during the early days of a clear Pentecostal identity and centralized support organizations have hitherto hampered accurate historical reconstructions. Except for targeted research by China historian Daniel Bays⁸, the topic has thus

⁵ For details, see R.G. Tiedemann, *Reference Guide to Christian Missionary Societies in China: From the 16th to the 20th Century* (Armonk, N.Y.: M.E. Sharpe, 2009).

⁶ See, for instance, the list of missionaries and missionary societies in *The China Mission Year Book, Being “The Christian Movement in China” 1915* (Shanghai: Christian Literature Society for China, 1915).

⁷ On the hardships faced by the early Pentecostal missionaries, see Gary B. McGee, *Miracles, Missions and American Pentecostalism* (Maryknoll, N.Y.: Orbis Books, 2010), pp. 146-153.

⁸ Daniel Bays, “The Protestant Missionary Establishment and the Pentecostal Movement”, in: Edith L. Blumhofer, Russell P. Spittler, and Grant A. Wacker (eds.), *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism* (Urbana and Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1999), pp. 50-67.

far received relatively little scholarly attention. In addition, Allan Anderson, Cecil Robeck and the late Gary McGee have provided scattered references as part of their outline studies of global Pentecostalism as a missionary movement.⁹ Yet a comprehensive and exhaustive scholarly account of the Pentecostal experience in China remains to be written. Given the current state of research, the present essay is a modest attempt to document the early Pentecostal presence in China and to record the organizational developments in their diverse forms.

The Pentecostals Are Coming to China

The Pentecostal movement came into being in a time of intense spiritual awakening among ‘radical evangelicals’ around the turn of the twentieth century. People experienced dreams, visions, prophecy, tongues and interpretations during religious revivals in different parts of the world. In this connection, the revivals in Topeka, Kansas, in 1901 and in other places¹⁰ provided some of the impulses to early Pentecostalism, yet they are also an indication of the diversity of its origins. To be sure, it is now generally agreed that it was the events at Azusa Street in 1906 which exercised a profound influence on the emerging Pentecostal missionary movements, for this revival brought home to many premillennialist Christians, who believed that they were living in ‘the last days’, the urgency of evangelizing non-Christian peoples. It was above all the Azusa Street periodical, *The Apostolic Faith*, which from 1906 onwards informed a world-wide readership of the events in Los Angeles, especially its insistence that speaking in unknown tongues was a demonstrable sign of having been baptized in the Holy Spirit. Moreover, the paper subsequently published letters from the Apostolic Faith missionaries who had gone out into the world.

⁹ Allan Anderson, *Spreading Fires: The Missionary Nature of Early Pentecostalism* (London: SCM Press, 2007), Chapter 5: “Opening Doors of Nations: China and East Asia”; Cecil M. Robeck, Jr., *The Azusa Street Mission and Revival* (Nashville: Nelson Reference & Electronic, 2006), passim; McGee, *Miracles, Missions and American Pentecostalism*, passim.

¹⁰ See, for example, the detailed discussion of the pre-Azusa Scandinavian Pentecostal phenomena in the upper Midwest, in Darrin J. Rodgers. *Northern Harvest: Pentecostalism in North Dakota* (Bismarck, N.D.: North Dakota District Council of the Assemblies of God, 2003).

Still, it has to be remembered that in these early days of heightened expectation, emerging Pentecostalism was not necessarily perceived to be a radical departure from the prevailing revivalist currents. As Allan Anderson has aptly put it,

Pentecostalism was in a process of formation that was not seen as a distinct form of Christianity at least until a decade after the revival and missionary movements in which it was entwined.... [I]t is a movement or rather a series of movements that took several years and several different formative ideas and events to emerge. Pentecostalism then as now is a polynucleated and variegated phenomenon.¹¹

For one thing, during the formative period, certain individuals played an important role in the emergence of the Pentecostal movement as forerunners or facilitators, but they and their organizations did not join the Pentecostal movement. Canadian-born Albert Benjamin Simpson (1843-1919), for example, and his Christian and Missionary Alliance (CMA), “which stood somewhere between the Holiness and higher life traditions”¹², had a significant impact on and was affected by the emerging Pentecostal movement, both in North America and in China.¹³ The English-born Baptist minister Joseph Smale (1867-1926) has been called “God’s ‘Moses’ for Pentecostalism”. Having been profoundly influenced by the Welsh Revival in the spring of 1905, Smale returned to Los Angeles and founded the First New Testament Church in September 1905. In March 1907, the short-lived China New Testament Mission was established in Beihai (Guangdong).¹⁴ As is

¹¹ Anderson, *Spreading Fires*, p. 4.

¹² Grant A. Wacker, “Travail of a Broken Family: Radical Evangelical Responses to the Emergence of Pentecostalism in American, 1906-16”, in: Blumhofer, Spittler and Grant (eds.), *Pentecostal Currents in American Protestantism*, p. 45 note 26.

¹³ Charles Nienkirchen, “A. B. Simpson: Forerunner and Critic of the Pentecostal Movement”, in: David F. Harzfeld and Charles Nienkirchen (eds.), *The Birth of a Vision* (Beaverlodge, Alberta: Buena Books Services, 1986), pp. 141-148.

¹⁴ Tim Welch: “Preparing the Way for the Azusa Street Revival: Joseph Smale, God’s ‘Moses’ for Pentecostalism”, *Assemblies of God Heritage* (2009), pp. 27-33. For a more detailed account of Smale’s “shifting Pentecostal perceptions”, see Timothy Bernard Welch, “‘God Found His Moses’: A

well known, John Alexander Dowie (1847-1907), the controversial faith healer, evangelist, and forerunner of Pentecostalism, organized the Christian Catholic Church in 1895, which after his death became the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church in Zion.¹⁵ Certainly, by 1902, this church had established a missionary presence in Shanghai.¹⁶ The Rev. William Henry Cossum (formerly of the American Baptist Missionary Union) and his wife Mary Celia Stillman Cossum were among the early members of the Chinese mission.¹⁷ There is no doubt that the Swedish Baptist minister John Ongman (1845-1931), who emphasised the imminent second coming of Christ, prophesy, the baptism of the Holy Spirit, and 'speaking with tongues'¹⁸, was deeply involved in the emergence of Swedish Pentecostalism. However, not everyone will agree with David Bundy's assertion that Ongman's Filadelfia Baptist congregation in Örebro developed into a "denomination of Swedish Pentecostal Holiness Baptists".¹⁹ Ongman's Örebro Missionary Society (*Örebro Missionsförening*), which played only a minor role in China, was understood to be a Baptist mission, as its Chinese name *Ruidianguo jinli hui* (Sweden Baptist Society) implies. These examples are indicative of some of the ambiguities that existed in perception and

Biographical and Theological Analysis of the Life of Joseph Smale (1867-1926)", Ph.D. diss., University of Birmingham, 2009.

¹⁵ Grant Wacker, "Marching to Zion: Religion in a Modern Utopian Community", *Church History* 54.4 (December 1985), pp. 496-511; Edith L. Blumhofer, "The Christian Catholic Apostolic Church and the Apostolic Faith: A Study in the 1906 Pentecostal Revival", in: Cecil M. Robeck, Jr. (ed.), *Charismatic Experiences in History* (Peabody, Mass.: Hendrickson, 1985), pp. 126-146.

¹⁶ *Chronicle and Directory for China, Japan and the Philippines*, Vol. 40 (Hongkong, 1902), p. 335; *The Directory and Chronicle for China, Japan, Corea, etc.*, Vol. 41 (Hongkong, 1903).

¹⁷ Note that Cossum delivered a number of lectures at the Stone Church, the significant early Pentecostal congregation in Chicago founded by William Hamner Piper, formerly Dowie's assistant in Zion City. The lectures were printed in the Pentecostal *Latter Rain Evangel* in the course of 1910.

¹⁸ G. M. Stephenson, *The Religious Aspect of Swedish Immigration*. (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1932; repr. New York, Arno Press, 1969), p. 128.

¹⁹ David Bundy, *Visions of Apostolic Mission: Scandinavian Pentecostal Mission to 1935* (Uppsala: Uppsala Universitet, 2009), p. 300.

reality during the formative years of Pentecostalism, also with reference to the situation on the mission fields in China.²⁰

The increased enthusiasm for world evangelization brought a number of Pentecostal evangelists to China during the decade or so following the Azusa Street Revival. The first to arrive were those who ventured abroad without any preparation, totally trusting the Spirit to lead them in their ministries. Moreover, relying on the efficacy of xenolalia, some expected to be able to preach in Chinese without having to first learn the language.²¹ Thus came families with young children as well as single men and women, some middle-aged, others very young. Widows made the journey, along with married individuals who had left their spouses behind. Being committed to the 'faith' principle, many left their home countries without adequate financial resources or institutional support. While a small minority had a college education and came from wealthier backgrounds, many of the early arrivals were lay preachers from the poorer strata of society with little formal education. Some of these evangelists had no specific denominational affiliation and relied for support on individuals or particular fellowships back home. Thus, not a few of these pioneers led rather precarious existences in unfamiliar environments. What had brought them to China was a burning desire to proclaim the gospel to the unreached peoples in these 'last days'.

A second category of early Pentecostal missionaries consists of men and women who had already spent some time in China with older 'faith' missions and were more attuned to life in China. They had become exposed to Pentecostal teachings and were baptized in the Spirit, either as a result of personal contacts in China or having been present at the Azusa Street revival. Indeed, Bernt Berntsen read about this revival in an early issue of *The Apostolic Faith* magazine at his mission station in Zhili province and thereupon travelled to Los Angeles in 1907. Others experienced the defining ecstatic manifestations while on homeland furlough. In this way several members of the Christian and Missionary Alliance, the China Inland

²⁰ Defining Pentecostalism remains a research problem. See Allan Anderson, Michael Bergunder, André Droogers, Cornelis van der Laan (eds.), *Studying Global Pentecostalism: Theories and Methods* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 2010).

²¹ For a general discussion of xenolalic convictions, see Gary B. McGee, "Shortcut to Language Preparation? Radical Evangelicals, Missions, and the Gift of Tongues", *International Bulletin of Missionary Research* (July 2001).

Mission and the South Chihli Mission joined the early Pentecostal movement. Their former missionary connections help explain the concentration of Pentecostal missions in particular parts of China.²² The influx of these more experienced missionaries, reinforced by the arrival of new forces from Europe and North America, as well as the emergent organizational structures would provide stability in the longer run.

Finally, it is important to note that the emergence of the Pentecostal missionary enterprise was not confined to the United States of America. Evangelists from Canada, Britain, Scandinavia and Germany were among the earliest Pentecostal workers in China.²³ Some travelled there directly from Europe, others had recently emigrated to North America before crossing the Pacific.

We must now turn to some of the individuals and groups who came to China in the wake of the Azusa Street revival. Identifying them is by no means an easy task. Initially, most of the early missionaries are listed in the Protestant directories under the general rubric of ‘Apostolic Faith Mission’ (*Shitu xinxin hui*), evidently a loose grouping of men and women influenced in one way or another by the Azusa Street revival, and to a lesser extent by Apostolic Faith movements in other parts of North America.²⁴ In later years they are more explicitly identified as ‘Pentecostals’ — and in some instances associated with particular strands of Pentecostalism. Still, not all foreign evangelists who may have had Pentecostal connections can be identified in the Protestant mission directories of China. Furthermore, the early

²² See also Allan Anderson, “Pentecostalism in India and China in the Early Twentieth Century and Inter-Religious Relations”, in; David Westerlund (ed.), *Global Pentecostalism: Encounters with Other Religious Traditions* (London; New York: I. B. Taurus, 2009), pp. 120-121.

²³ The Norwegian revivalist Thomas Ball Barratt (1862-1940) was instrumental in spreading the Pentecostal message to other parts of Europe, influencing Alexander Boddy in England, Lewi Pethrus in Sweden and Jonathan Paul in Germany.

²⁴ The *Directory of Protestant Missionaries in China, Japan and Corea for the Year 1910* (Hongkong: The Hongkong Daily Press Office, 1910), p. 12, lists 26 foreigners and 4 Chinese under the Apostolic Faith Mission, along with 4 Chinese. Three foreigners, who are known to have been connected with the Pentecostal movement, are listed in the ‘Independent’ category. These entries reflect the state of affairs in 1909. In 1910, a great variety of new Pentecostal missionaries arrived in China.

Pentecostal periodicals usually contained lists of donations intended for particular individuals, yet a careful perusal of these lists reveals that not all recipients were of the Pentecostal persuasion.

The Hongkong-Macau Missions

Many observers consider Thomas James McIntosh (1879-1955) and Alfred Gallatin Garr (1874-1944)²⁵ and their wives the initiators of the Pentecostal presence in China. McIntosh was born in Lynchburg, South Carolina, to the very young day labourer Thomas W. McIntosh. Having received the 'tongue experience' in 1907, he and his wife Annie Eleanor Edens (1882-) and daughter Hazel went to China with some support from the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina. After a brief stopover in Los Angeles, the family arrived in Macao on 7 August 1907, where they were said to have been met by an expectant audience, including several missionaries vacationing there.²⁶

McIntosh was followed by the Alfred Gallatin Garr and family who arrived in Hongkong from India on 9 October 1907, having received an invitation from several single women missionaries to speak in the British colony.²⁷ Detailed information about Garr's early life is scarce and not necessarily accurate. Although Garr was "one of the most important early Pentecostal leaders, the autobiographical and biographical materials remain sketchy and inconsistent".²⁸ He was born on 27 July 1875 in Boyle County, Kentucky. The 1900 census lists him as a locomotive fireman in Lexington. Before coming to Hongkong, Garr and his wife Lillian Anderson, whom he had met in 1898 during

²⁵ According to an unnamed source, Alfred Gallatin Garr changed his middle name to Goodrich in 1914.

²⁶ This sketch of McIntyre relies heavily on Daniel Woods, "Failure and Success in the Ministry of T.J. McIntosh, the First Pentecostal Missionary to China", *Cyberjournal for Pentecostal-Charismatic Research* No. 12 (February 2003), <file://E:\McIntoshPentecostal.htm>; accessed 20 September 2005.

²⁷ Robeck, *The Azusa Street Mission and Revival*, p. 256.

²⁸ Grant Wacker, *Heaven Below: Early Pentecostals and American Culture* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 2nd printing, 2003), p. 289, note 98. See also G.B. McGee, "Alfred Goodrich Garr, Sr.", in: Burgess and McGee (eds.), *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, pp. 328-329. For a recent biography, see Steve Thompson and Adam Gordon, *A 20th Century Apostle: The Life of Alfred Garr* (Wilkesboro, NC : Morning Star Publications, 2003).

his brief spell at Asbury College,²⁹ had spent some time in India. Garr's passport application of 1906 also includes his Afro-American "servant" Mariah Gardener who was born in the Danville area of Virginia.

Three days after the Garrs' arrival, Eliza May Law (1873-) and Rosa Pittman (1885-1986) landed at Hongkong. They were members of a large party of Apostolic Faith missionaries who, led by Pastor Martin Lawrence Ryan (1869-1963), had left Seattle for Japan in early September 1907. Law and Pittman continued their journey from Tokyo to Hongkong, "because they felt they had the gift of the 'Hongkong' dialect", arriving there on 12 October. In January 1908 two more single women of the Ryan group, Cora Fritsch (1888-1912) and Bertha Effie Milligan (1886-1973), made their way from Japan to Hongkong.³⁰ In the meantime, McIntosh in Macao had also received reinforcements, namely Annie McIntosh's aunt, Mrs Annie E. Kirby (nee Eagerton), and seventeen-year-old Mabel Evans of Largo, Florida. Kirby had embraced the Pentecostal experience during a revival led by McIntosh and Gaston Barnabas Cashwell in Berkeley county, South Carolina.³¹ Having travelled via Los Angeles, San Francisco and Honolulu, they arrived in Hongkong on 9 January 1908. After a few weeks with McIntosh in Macao, Kirby and Evans left for Canton toward the end of February, accompanied by Fannie Winn (who could speak Chinese).³²

Although there had been some encouraging beginnings in Macao and Hongkong, both McIntosh and Garr turned out to be restless

²⁹ On Garr's early career and involvement with the Burning Bush movement prior to his Pentecostal experience, see William Kostlevy, *Holy Jumpers: Evangelicals and Radicals in Progressive Era America* (New York: Oxford University Press, 2010), passim. Lillian Anderson was daughter of a prominent Methodist minister.

³⁰ For further details, see Bays, "The Protestant Missionary Establishment and the Pentecostal Movement", p. 53.

³¹ She received "the blessed Holy Ghost, who speaks with new tongues" on 7 February 1907. Kirby, Los Angeles, 3 December 1907, in *The Bridegroom's Messenger* 1.4 (15 December 1907), p. 1.

³² Kirby and Evans to Cashwell, Canton, 3 March 1908, *The Bridegroom's Messenger* 1.13 (1 May 1908), p. 1. Fannie Winn, "How God Has Blessed the Work of Our Missionaries in China", *The Bridegroom's Messenger* (1 June 1908), p. 2. Fannie Pearl Winn had left the United States on 18 November 1903 with the S. C. Todds.

globetrotters³³ during these early days of the Pentecostal missionary enterprise China. Daniel Woods said of McIntosh: “Always starting things that he never finished, he rarely stayed anywhere more than a few months.” In May 1908 the McIntosh family left for Palestine, and after a few months there, returned to the United States. The restless Garrs, too, were on the move. They had left Yokohama on 24 June 1908 and arrived in Seattle on 8 July 1908. Yet on 3 September 1909, they left home once more for Hongkong and did not return to the United States until late January 1912. Not to be outdone, the McIntosh family, too, made their way back to Hongkong in December 1909, but no sooner had they arrived there, the Garrs decided to make a trip to Bombay. McIntosh was thus left in charge of the mission and the small but expanding band of missionaries. He now began to explore the interior of Guangdong province and established Xi’nan [Sainam] on the West River as a mission station. But it was not long before McIntosh abandoned the field once more. After a brief sojourn in Jerusalem, he and his family were soon back in South Carolina.³⁴ He was subsequently expelled from the Pentecostal Holiness Church “on the grounds of apostasy” and lived for some years in Charleston as an insurance salesman. He subsequently moved to Camden, SC, where he appears to have exercised some kind of ministry.³⁵

All in all, the early Pentecostal enterprise did not get off to a good start in South China. The comings and goings of the two senior missionaries surely did not help matters. Moreover, relations with members of other societies were proving increasingly difficult, especially in Hongkong. Although initially the Garrs had been able to use the premises of the American Board mission in Hongkong, the Rev. Charles R. Hager quickly denied them further access. A. G. Garr complained at the beginning of 1908: “There is not one missionary standing with us in Hong Kong. Further up in China there are a number that have received the Pentecostal blessing, but in Hong Kong the

³³ It was reported the McIntosh published a little book in 1909, with the suggestive title *The Life and Trip of T.J. McIntosh and Wife and Little Girl, Around the World*.

³⁴ He arrived in New York City with his wife, daughter Hazel Lois and infant son Thomas James, Jr., on 13 November 1911 in the *George Washington* from Southampton, their final destination being St. Stephens, SC.

³⁵ Information gleaned from the 1920 and 1930 federal census lists and from his death certificate.

Chinese are the only ones....”³⁶

At first, the situation was more encouraging in neighbouring Macao, where McIntosh had several meetings with a large number of missionaries on vacation in the Portuguese colony shortly after his arrival in August 1907. Two visiting Christian and Missionary Alliance missionaries, Frank Porter Hamill and Miss Rosa Alice Edwards, from the CMA station at Wuzhou appear to have been particularly receptive to the Pentecostal message. Afterwards, the CMA mission at Wuzhou and other places in Guangxi province experienced a revival, with evidence of divine healing, glossolalia and other ecstatic manifestations.³⁷ Yet in the end, none of the CMA missionaries joined the Pentecostal movement. Hamill stayed with the CMA mission until he retired from the field in 1916. Edwards, having married fellow CMA missionary Weldon Grant Smith, remained in the mission until 1921, when the couple established a small independent work at Guixian, Guangxi, with possible links to the United Free Gospel Mission. The only ‘success’ among the South China missionary community was Fannie Pearl Winn, but as we have seen, she returned to the United States at the beginning of 1909.

Having received the gift of tongues, the early Pentecostal missionaries in South China were certain in their conviction that they would be able to talk in the local language. Yet their inability to instantaneously speak Cantonese prevented them from engaging in direct evangelism among Chinese. Hence their crucial reliance from the start on the Chinese evangelist Mok Lai Chi (*putonghua*: Mo Lizhi), a school proprietor and a Christian lay leader in Hongkong. However, it was not long before Mok set up his own Pentecostal work and in January 1908 began publication of a Pentecostal periodical, the *Wuxunjie zhenliba* [Pentecostal Truths], which achieved nationwide distribution. As Daniel Bays has observed, “This group and newspaper are important because the paper directly influenced the North China founders of the first major Chinese Pentecostal church, the True Jesus Church.”³⁸ It is interesting to note that when Mok Lai Chi established a

³⁶ Garr to Cashwell, Hongkong, 19 January 1908, *The Bridegroom’s Messenger* 1.9 (1 March 1908), p. 4.

³⁷ See the letter from CMA missionary Ethel F. Landis in *The Bridegroom’s Messenger* 1.9 (1 March 1908), p. 2.

³⁸ Daniel H. Bays, “Indigenous Protestant Churches in China, 1900-1937: A Pentecostal Case Study”, in: Steven Kaplan (ed.), *Indigenous Responses to Western Christianity* (New York & London: New York University Press, 1995),

separate work, the elderly Anna Maria Deane (1854-1918) also distanced herself from the McIntosh-Garr project and built her own enduring mission in Hongkong.

In the end, except for the fruitful beginnings at Xi'n'an [Sainam], McIntosh and Garr had accomplished relatively little in South China, certainly in terms of their own expectations. At the same time, the missionaries of mainline denominations and the Christian and Missionary Alliance were becoming increasingly hostile. It was, however, the Rev. Samuel Charlton Todd (1870-1908) who launched perhaps the severest attack in the *Baptist Argus* (Louisville, Ky., 23 January 1908) under the title, "Some Sad Failures of Tongues in Mission Fields". Todd argued that in the cases he had investigated, none of the missionaries were able to demonstrate the gift of missionary tongues.³⁹ Another critical account, possibly by Todd, accused McIntosh of ignorance "so great that he can read only simple English" and Garr of abusive rhetoric against those who disagreed with him.⁴⁰

While there is no doubt some truth in these observations, Todd's own story tells us something about the fluidity among radical evangelicals at this time. He was born in Laurens, South Carolina, and had been ordained a Presbyterian clergyman in 1896. Afterwards he became associated with the CMA. Having married Lilian Fanny Lamont (1869-1954), widow of the CMA China missionary Clarence Hamlin Reeves, he left the United States on 18 November 1903. The couple was accompanied by Fannie Pearl Winn of Macon, Georgia.⁴¹ At Macao, they established the Bible Mission Society, which evidently had a Baptist orientation. Following Todd's death, the Bible Mission Society at Macao was transferred to the Foreign Mission Board of the Southern Baptist Convention on 1 January 1910. The Todds may have rejected Spirit baptism and speaking in tongues, but the former missionaries of the Bible Mission Society were given special dispensation to retain their practice of divine healing — with certain

p. 129. For a more detailed account of Mok's Pentecostal career, see Anderson, *Spreading Fires*, pp. 117-123.

³⁹ Wacker, *Heaven Below*, p. 288 note 74. See also

⁴⁰ Cited in Robeck, *The Azusa Street Mission and Revival*, p. 246.

⁴¹ It is not inconceivable that Todd's anti-Pentecostal outbursts was provoked by Fannie Winn's defection to the Pentecostal camp.

reservations on behalf of the Foreign Mission Board.⁴² Mrs. Todd married the Canadian missionary John Laurels Galloway (1877-1968) and served the Southern Baptist Convention until her death in 1954.

North China

A second centre of early Pentecostal activities emerged in the southern districts of Zhili (from 1928 called Hebei) province. Here the link with missionary societies already in the field became an important point of departure. Bernt Berntsen (1863-1933)⁴³ played a significant role in the emerging Apostolic Faith movement in this part of North China. Born in the hamlet of Hedrum near Larvik, Norway, he emigrated to the United States in 1893. Having become naturalized American citizens, he and his Norwegian-born wife Magna Berg (1867-1935) and their two small boys left San Francisco in October 1904 with a large group of missionaries for service in the non-denominational South Chihli Mission.⁴⁴ During his initial sojourn in southern Zhili province, Berntsen read about the Azusa Street Revival in an early issue of *The Apostolic Faith* (Los Angeles). He thereupon travelled to Los Angeles, where he was baptized in the Spirit on 15 September 1907. In late November 1907, he returned to China with eleven recruits, consisting of two married couples and their children, as well as two single men and five single women. "They went out trusting God alone for their support."⁴⁵ The party arrived on 1 January 1908 in Zhengding, which would become the principal Pentecostal station in

⁴² William R. Estep, *Whole Gospel Whole World: The Foreign Mission Board of the Southern Baptist Convention 1845-1995* (Nashville, Tenn.: Broadman & Holman, 1994), pp. 170-171.

⁴³ Until very recently Berntsen has remained an obscure figure. The fact that some sources have spelled his surname 'Bernsten' and 'Bernstein' has complicated the search for the real Bernt Berntsen. For some details concerning his Pentecostal missionary activities in China, see Robeck, *The Azusa Street Mission and Revival*, pp. 260-262. The present sketch has been painstakingly pieced together from numerous scattered sources.

⁴⁴ The group had first gathered at the interdenominational Training School for Christian Workers in Los Angeles. See the 'China Band' photo of 4 October 1904 in *The Witness and Training School News* 4.5 (Feb-Mar 1905), supplement. I would like to thank Ken Otto, curator at Azusa Pacific University, for having sent me the relevant material.

⁴⁵ *The Apostolic Faith* 1.11 (Los Angeles, October-January 1908), p. 1.

southern Zhili. Berntsen described this new field as follows: “It is on the railroad line south of Peking, a big field, and to open our home for any independent worker filled with the Holy Ghost and fire, to come and stay with us until they are sure where God wants them.” He added, “Pray for a dwelling-place and a home convenient for Chinese orphans.”⁴⁶

The composition of Berntsen’s group highlights, among other things, the prevalence of immigrants in the American missionary presence in China.⁴⁷ Thus, Gustaf S. Lundgren and his future wife Ellen O. Carlson, as well as Adolf Johnson and his wife-to-be Linda Erickson had emigrated to the U.S. from Sweden. George and Sophie Hansen were from Norway. Maria Sophia Björkman (1870-1940) had come to America from Finland in 1902. Young Emma Birgithe Hansen arrived with her family in the U.S. from Norway in 1906, but left her immigrant parents a year later to join Berntsen’s band.⁴⁸ Roy Jerome Hess (1875-1937) and his wife Mary Lydia Omann (1878-1964) were the only American-born members of the group. However, a closer look at the respective movements of Mr. and Mrs. Hess prior to coming to China reveals that both had taken part in the great internal American migration. Roy Hess was born in Goshen, Indiana, but the family moved first to Chicago and, after 1900, to California. Mary Omann had similarly moved in stages from Wisconsin to California, where she married Hess in 1905. Americans were generally on the move, always ready to explore new opportunities. A good many China missionaries had been part of these wanderings. Rosa Pittman, for example, was born in Minnesota, but the family joined the westward migration and eventually ended up in Latah, Washington. Given that American society was in flux, it is quite conceivable that the geographic migrations facilitated the radical religious migrations in the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. Perhaps it is, therefore, not surprising that those peripatetic souls who had recently embraced Pentecostalism and were under the influence of end-time fervour, were eager to spread the good news in foreign parts.

⁴⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁷ All adult members of the group are mentioned in Berntsen’s “Letter from China”, *The Bridegroom’s Messenger* 1.14 (15 May 1908), p. 2. No information has come to light concerning the eleventh member of Berntsen’s party, Hanna Holmsten [or Helmsten].

⁴⁸ For her initial report from China, see Emma Hansen, “A Sixteen-Year-Old Missionary”, *The Pentecost* 1.7 (Kansas City, Mo., June 1909), p. 4.

In addition to bringing evangelists to China from North America, Berntsen also established contacts with the leaders of the emerging Pentecostal movement in Scandinavia. As David Bundy has recently shown, he sent letters and reports to the Norwegian periodicals *Byposten* and *Korsets Seir* published by Thomas Ball Barratt (1862-1940) and *Det Gode Budskap* published by Erik Andersen Nordquelle (1858-1938).⁴⁹ In April 1910, Berntsen travelled overland to Europe and spent several months in Denmark, Norway and Sweden to garner support for his Apostolic Faith enterprise. His sojourn in Scandinavia encouraged several individuals to become Pentecostal evangelists in China. Among those who departed for southern Zhili in 1911 were Einar Johan Christiansen [also Kristiansen] and his wife Rilda from Norway, as well as Dagny Pedersen from Denmark. In 1923, Pedersen would become the first representative of the Apostolic Church Mission in China. Another Dane, Nils Peter Rasmussen and his family made their way to Zhengding in 1913.⁵⁰

In 1914, Abraham Lovalien Heidal (1891-1969) started a small, independent Pentecostal work, known as the Assembly of God – Good News Mission, in the Zhengding area. Relying on the support Scandinavian Pentecostal churches connected with the Assembly of God Missionary Fellowship in the American Midwest and Canada, he was able to open a permanent station at Gaoyi in 1916. For a number of years he and his Swedish-born wife Hilma Lavinia Gustafson (1891-1962) – who had arrived in Zhengding from Chicago in 1911 as an Apostolic Faith missionary⁵¹ and whom he had married in 1915 – carried on the work until they were interned by the Japanese in 1942.⁵²

Thus, we see the emergence of a Scandinavian Pentecostal missionary enterprise in several localities around Zhengding. Yet it was not just Scandinavians who undertook the early Pentecostal work in Zhili province. For one thing, there were other members of the South

⁴⁹ See the scattered references to Berntsen in David Bundy, *Visions of Apostolic Mission*, pp. 228-229, 241-242.

⁵⁰ These and other Scandinavians bound for southern Zhili are mentioned in Asbjørn Froholt, *De Frie Evangeliske Forsamlingers Misjon. 75 år. Et jubileumsskrift* (Moss: Elias Forlag, [1982]), pp. 103-112.

⁵¹ She had arrived in the U.S. from Sweden as Hilma Johansson in 1909, but changed her surname to Gustafson.

⁵² For a brief account of Heidal and the pre-Azusa Assembly of God Missionary Fellowship, see Rodgers, *Northern Harvest*, pp. 58-62.

Chihli Mission who became or are assumed to have become Pentecostals. Drusie Reubelt Malott (1882-1937) from Kentucky had arrived in the South Chihli Mission in 1904. After three years in that mission, she spent a few years with the Ebenezer Mission in Henan, before coming into the Pentecostal work at Zhengding.⁵³ The Pentecostal connection is not so explicit in the case of American missionary Martha (“Mattie”) Frances Brann (1876-1959). Born in Illinois, she joined the South Chihli Mission in China in 1911. In the 1920s and 1930s, Mattie Brann was a frequent contributor to the *Latter Rain Evangel*.⁵⁴ To confuse matters, she and several other persons were listed both under the South Chihli Mission and under the general heading of “Pentecostal Missionaries” in the 1915 *China Mission Year Book*.

It is not known whether Bernt Berntsen or other former members of the South Chihli Mission influenced Thomas Junk to come to North China in 1908. Although present during the early stages of the Azusa Street revival, he has remained an elusive character in the history of the Pentecostal movement. Thomas Jönck was born in 1861 in the duchy of Schleswig, which at that time was still under Danish suzerainty but became German in 1864. In 1888, he emigrated to California with two younger sisters and Anglicized his surname to Junk. He and his German-born wife Helene became naturalized U.S. citizens in 1902. Upon leaving the Azusa Street Mission, he (and presumably his wife Helene) accompanied Florence Crawford on an evangelistic tour of northern California, Oregon and Washington in the summer of 1906. Next, we catch a glimpse of the Junks in Honolulu where they had arrived on 10 March 1907. Annie Kirby and Mabel Evans had a brief meeting with them when their China-bound ship stopped in Honolulu in late 1907.⁵⁵ According to his passport application of 1909, Junk stated that he left the U.S. on 23 March 1908, arriving in Shanghai on 10 April.⁵⁶ It has not been possible to establish why he chose the small

⁵³ *The Bridegroom’s Messenger* 9 (1 August 1916), p. 3.

⁵⁴ In particular, see her address to the Stone Church Young People in Chicago: Mattie Brann, “Marvellous Results of Preaching the Old-Fashioned Gospel: A Chinese Testimony Meeting by Proxy”, *The Latter Rain Evangel* 20.3 (December 1927), pp. 5-9.

⁵⁵ Kirby and Evans, on board the *Korea*, 27 December 1907, *The Bridegroom’s Messenger* 1.9 (1 March 1908), p. 12.

⁵⁶ National Archives and Records Administration (NARA), Washington D.C.; Passport Applications, January 2, 1906 - March 31, 1925; ARC Identifier

town of Caoxian in the hinterland of Shandong province as his base of missionary operations. To be sure, Henry Bartel, initially a member of the South Chihli Mission, had recently set up headquarters of the newly established China Mennonite Mission Society in Caoxian. In any case, Thomas Junk is known to have evangelized in the area until about 1911, supported by the Upper Room Mission in Los Angeles and the Stone Church of Chicago.⁵⁷

The Pentecostal message was also brought directly from Germany to Shandong. The diverse evangelical currents that had swept across Germany in the late nineteenth century caused a revival in the town of Velbert around the turn of the twentieth century, leading to the formation of an independent free church (still known as *Freie evangelische Gemeinde*) there. When news of Azusa Street reached this church in 1907 and the first testimonies of Spirit baptism and speaking in tongues occurred, the free church split and the Christian Fellowship (*Christliche Gemeinschaft Velbert*) came into being as a separate Pentecostal church in 1908. In the same year this new church sent Adolf Wieneke (1879-1955) and his wife Maria Kreuzer to China. Having spent a brief period of cultural acclimatization the small American Baptist 'Gospel Mission', in Tai'an (Shandong), the Wienekes established a work of their own in nearby Jining (Shandong). By the 1920s they had been joined by Helene Hackländer. In 1935 Johannes Wieneke (1910-1967) joined his parents as a missionary. In 1940 he married Agnes Bartel (1908-1984), the daughter of the Mennonite missionary Henry Bartel. This establishment in Jining remained an independent Pentecostal 'faith mission' right up to the end of the missionary era in China.⁵⁸

The Gospel Mission at Tai'an was also the first port of call for two

583830 / MLR Number A1 534; NARA Series: M1490; Roll #92. Note that his identity was verified by the Mennonite missionary Jonathan J. Schrag (1875-1930) at Caoxian on 26 April 1909. Because Junk requested the passport only for himself, it can be assumed that his wife died in late 1908 or early 1909.

⁵⁷ C.M. Robeck, Jr., "Junk, Thomas", in: Stanley M. Burgess and Gary B. McGee (eds.), *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Zondervan Publishing House, 1988), p. 514.

⁵⁸ Typical of such small independent missions, only a few tiny fragments of historical data have come to light concerning the Wieneke group. For a brief general overview of German Pentecostal missions, see Joost Reinke, *Deutsche Pfingstmissionen: Geschichte, Theologie, Praxis* (Bonn: Verlag für Kultur und Wissenschaft, 1997).

other missionary couples. Leslie M. Anglin (1882-1942) and his wife Ava Patton Anglin (1884-1952) had left the U.S. on 8 November 1910. Jennie Brinson Rushin, nee Virginia B. Bradler (1887-1979), left her home in Valdosta, Georgia, with her second husband, Perrin Roy Rushin, and two children in late 1914, arriving in Shanghai on 16 December. They, too, stayed at the Gospel Mission upon their arrival in Tai'an. Indeed, Mrs Rushin, who was a Baptist, had come to Tai'an to give support to Mr Anglin's work. It should also be noted that when Mr Rushin applied in DeKalb county for a passport in 1914, Mrs Celestia Ennis Kerr, editor of the Gospel Baptist periodical *Our Missionary Helper*, Decatur, DeKalb County, verified his identity. Initially the Gospel Baptists "were made to rejoice by the coming of new missionaries to work with them, but soon it became evident that they were not true Baptists, for they taught seeking the 'baptism of the Holy Spirit' and were speaking in tongues. There were seven of them against three, but the American Consul upheld those who were Baptists, and the others left for another part of the city to build a work."⁵⁹ The Anglins opened the Home of Onesiphorus in Tai'an for abandoned and orphaned children in 1916.⁶⁰ At about the same time, the Rushins started an independent Pentecostal work in the Tai'an area. From February 1917 to October 1918 the family spent some time in the Philippines. Upon their return to China, they set up their base in Ji'nan, the provincial capital of Shandong.⁶¹ It is only from late 1915 onward that the Anglins and Rushins are mentioned in the Pentecostal periodicals.

⁵⁹ John R. Blalock, *T. L. Blalock, China Missionary*, pp. 6-7; http://jrhenness4.home.comcast.net/~jrhenness4/calhac/misc/mi_blalock_tl_ind ex.htm . On the tensions, see also Rebekah E. Adams, *Called to China: Attie Bostick's Life and Missionary Letters From China: 1900-1943* (Huntsville, Alabama: Halldale Publishing Company, 2006), pp. 44-45. The three 'true' Baptists at Tai'an were Thomas Lee Blalock and wife and Miss Attie T. Bostick. The seven opponents were Mr. and Mrs. Wieneke, Mr. and Mrs. Anglin, Anglin's younger sister Ruth, as well Mr. and Mrs. Rushin. *China Mission Year Book ... 1915*, "Directory", p.18.

⁶⁰ Harry J. Albus, *Twentieth-Century Onesiphorus: The Story of Leslie M. Anglin and the Home of Onesiphorus* (Grand Rapids, Mich.: Eerdmans, 1951).

⁶¹ David Bundy, "Jennie Brinson-Rushin: Pioneer China Missionary" *Church of God History and Heritage* (summer/fall 1999), pp. 5-7.

Apostolic Faith Missionaries in Shanghai

By the early twentieth century, the international metropolis of Shanghai served as a major base for several Protestant mainline and evangelical societies. It is, therefore, not surprising that the city became the third early centre of Apostolic Faith missionary activities. Among the early arrivals were George and Sofia Hansen and Roy J. and Lydia M. Hess⁶² who had initially been part of Bernt Berntsen's mission in Zhili province. Homer Levi Lawler (1869-1944), his wife Emma Bell Rednour (1875-1955), their daughter Estelle Beatrice Lawler (1894-1970) and son Fay Harland Lawler (1895-) had been part of the Japan mission established by Martin Lawrence Ryan, but had returned to the U.S. from Yokohama on 30 December 1907, after only a few months in Japan. In late December 1910, Mrs. Lawler and her two children crossed the Pacific once more to join the Apostolic Faith Mission in Shanghai. Homer Lawler joined them at a later date.⁶³ In 1912, Ryan himself abandoned the Japan mission and settled in Shanghai to continue the publication of his *Apostolic Light* periodical. He returned to the United States in 1915.

It was quite rare for missionaries of mainline denominations to join the Pentecostal movement. In this regard, the case of Antoinette ("Nettie") Moomau (1873-1937) is well known. Born in Iowa, she had come to China as an American Presbyterian (North) missionary in 1899. On leaving China on furlough in October 1906, she was asked by her mission to investigate the Apostolic Faith Movement in Los Angeles, "where they claimed to have manifested the same gifts of the Holy

⁶² A letter dated 1 October 1908 from Roy Hess, who had received his Pentecost in the upper room in the old Azusa Street Mission, indicates that he and George Hansen and wife had been in Shanghai about five months. *Bridegroom's Messenger* 2.26 (15 Nov 1908), p. 1. However, the Hess family returned to the U.S. some time in 1909 and settled into farming in California. Their second daughter, Grace Lois, was born on 12 September 1909 near Los Angeles.

⁶³ According to Emma Lawler's 1910 passport application, her husband was travelling to Palestine at that time. Attached to Homer Lawler's 1916 passport application is a letter from the Pentecostal Mission and Apostolic Assembly of Seattle, Washington, confirming that Lawler was "a properly ordained minister of the Gospel, and is working in connection with this Assembly as evangelist and missionary". Pastor William Henry Offiler signed the letter.

Ghost as of old”⁶⁴. During her visit at the Azusa Street Mission she was baptized in the Spirit. She thereupon returned to China, taking along Leola Phillips (1878-1910) from Indiana. Although her companion died from smallpox two years later, Nettie Moomau enjoyed many years as an Apostolic Faith missionary in Shanghai and Suzhou.

However, the process of religious migration could also be in reverse, as in the case of Lillian Holmes Keyes (1889-1965) and Edith Emily Gumbrell (1875-1922), former members of Joseph Smale’s newly established First New Testament Church in Los Angeles. Young Miss Keyes had gained some negative publicity in the local press on account of ‘gift of tongues’ and her subsequent confrontation with Smale, whereupon her father, Dr. Henry Sheridan Keyes, and another prominent member, Elmer Kirk Fisher, left Smale’s church to establish the Upper Room Mission in Los Angeles in September 1906. In the summer of 1908, the Misses Keyes and Gumbrell, accompanied by George Webb Cram (1865-) and his wife Fannie Louise Patterson (1858-1947) left as Pentecostal missionaries for China, arriving in Baoding, Zhili province, on 1 August 1908. Except for Berntsen’s brief reference to their Chinese language studies, little is known about their activities until 1911, when the two women joined the American Presbyterian mission at Baoding. In 1916, Lillian Keyes married the Presbyterian clergyman Richard E. Jenness (1890-1941) and worked as a missionary at Baoding and Shunde (now called Xingtai) until 1950.⁶⁵

As the Pentecostal mission movement expanded in China after 1910, the ‘Apostolic Faith Mission’ label covering a loose association of early North American Pentecostal missionaries began to disappear from the periodical literature — except in Shanghai where it retained a more concrete meaning. Following the death of Anna Scheidegger (1870-1931), who came from a Mennonite background in Indiana and had been with the Door of Hope Mission in Shanghai from 1907 to 1915, the U.S. consular death certificate stated quite specifically that she had been a member of the Apostolic Faith Mission.⁶⁶ However, by

⁶⁴ Antoinette Moomau, Eustice, Nebraska, *The Apostolic Faith* 1.11 (Los Angeles,), p. 3.

⁶⁵ Robeck, *Azusa Street Mission and Revival*, pp. 248-249. The party had arrived in Shanghai on 21 July 1908: *Chinese Recorder* 39.8 (August 1908), p. 470.

⁶⁶ Report of the Death of an American Citizen, Shanghai, 24 February 1931, National Archives and Records Administration (NARA), Washington, D.C.; General Records of the Department of State; Record Group: RG59-Entry

this time the Shanghai work had essentially become a Canadian enterprise, with home support based in Vancouver. The English-born Canadian Thomas Harwood and wife Mary Ethel had been Apostolic Faith missionaries in China since 1910. A Miss E. L. Brown (probably Louise E. Brown), who had been in China since 1912, was representing the Apostolic Faith Mission in Shanghai as late as 1936. Moreover, there seems to have been a close working relationship with the Pacific Coast Missionary Society (PCMS), which had begun in British Columbia as a group of churches with roots in the Apostolic Faith Mission of Portland, Oregon. It was under the PCMS name that several stations were operating in northern Zhejiang province, the oldest of which was opened by Thomas Harwood at Hangzhou in 1913.⁶⁷

It should be noted that the Pentecostal message had also been carried to China from the Hebden Mission in Toronto. Arthur Manley Atter (1874-1937) and his wife Jessie Mornelvia Snyder spent only a few months in Shanghai in 1909.⁶⁸ George Christian Slager (1886-1968), who had been a witness to the early establishment of Pentecostalism in Toronto,⁶⁹ and his wife Harriet Abigail Chant (1889-1959) reached Shanghai in 1910 had a rather longer career in China. Also in 1909, Thomas Hindle (1870-1969) and his wife Louise Siegrist (1886-1964) left for the East. According to Bernt Berntsen, the Hindles had arrived in Baoding,⁷⁰ presumably to study the Chinese language. In

205;Box Number: 1817: 1930-1939 China Sc – Sy. According to Sue Gronewold, the Door of Hope Mission had by the 1920s developed “evangelical and even pentecostal tendencies”. Sue Ellen Gronewold, “Encountering Hope: The Door of Hope Mission in Shanghai and Taipei 1900-1976”, Ph.D. diss., Columbia University, 1996, p. 299.

⁶⁷ For the basic details, see Tiedemann, *Reference Guide to Christian Missionary Societies*, pp. 121-122, 196-197.

⁶⁸ Antoinette Moomau and Leola Phillips report the Atters’ arrival in *The Pentecost* 1.11 (15 October 1909). On 14 December 1909, they and their son Gordon Francis Atter (1905-1998) were back in Vancouver. *Passenger Lists, 1865–1935*. Microfilm Publication Roll T-4851. Library and Archives Canada, RG 76-C. Department of Employment and Immigration fonds. Library and Archives Canada Ottawa, Ontario, Canada.

⁶⁹ See Thomas William Miller, “The Canadian Jerusalem: The story of James and Ellen Hebden and their Toronto mission”, *Assemblies of God Heritage* 11.3 (Fall 1991), p. 6. Dutch-born Slager, whose actual name was Gerardus Christiaan Slager, married Harriet Abigail Chant (1889-1959) of Toronto.

the same year, they became the first Pentecostals to venture into what is now Inner Mongolia. They spent several decades in evangelistic endeavours beyond the Great Wall. Mention should also be made of Irish-born Canadian Robert James Semple, husband of Aimee Semple McPherson, who set out for Hongkong from Canada in 1910, but contracted malaria and died a few weeks after his arrival.

The Pentecostal Movement Spreads in China

From about 1910 onward, Pentecostalism began to spread beyond the three early centres of the Apostolic Faith movement in China. Except for Beijing, these new areas of evangelization were more difficult to reach, well beyond the coastal ports and railways. In North China Scandinavian and American Pentecostals began to move into Shanxi province and northern Zhili. It is not known whether Berntsen's sojourn in Scandinavia in 1910 had any bearing on the decision to establish a Norwegian Pentecostal presence in China. In the same year Parley Gulbrandsen (1889-1959), John Cairns Beruldsen (1883-1953) and their families, along with others, travelled to the northern part of Zhili province as the first representatives of the non-Pentecostal [North] Chihli Mission (*Tsjilimissionen* — later known as the Norwegian Mission Alliance), which had been founded by Edvard Eriksen (1866-1924) in 1901. It was not until T. B. Barratt established Norway's Free Evangelical Mission to the Heathen (NFEH) in 1916 that these evangelists became attached to a specifically Pentecostal organization while retaining their links with the Norwegian Mission Alliance.⁷¹ When the NFEH was dissolved in 1934, its former missionaries were supported by local Norwegian Pentecostal assemblies. The work at home as well as on the mission field was based on voluntary co-operation under the collective term 'Norwegian Evangelical Mission'.⁷²

⁷⁰ Berntsen, undated report in *The Bridegroom's Messenger* 3.51 (1 December 1909), p. 3. He also mentions the arrival of W. H. Burns from Toronto, as well as three Canadian sisters who left Zhengding for Baoding to study the Chinese language. It has not been possible to identify these individuals.

⁷¹ For details, see Bundy, *Visions of Apostolic Mission*, especially the section "Parley Gulbrandsen: From the Tsjili Mission to Pentecostal Mission", pp. 337-340.

⁷² For an overview, see Tiedemann, *Reference Guide to Christian Missionary Societies*, pp.188-190.

It was, however, in the western Chinese provinces of Yunnan and Gansu where a substantial Pentecostal work began to develop. Whereas the early Pentecostals in the Hongkong-Macao area had failed to attract missionaries from established missions, in the districts bordering on Tibet several members of the China Inland Mission and the Christian and Missionary Alliance responded to the Pentecostal message. Perhaps the most notable convert was Cecil Polhill-Turner, later known as Cecil Henry Polhill (1860-1938). Whereas many Pentecostal missionaries came from humble backgrounds, he was born into the wealthy Polhill-Turner family of Howbury Hall near Bedford, England. In 1885, he went to China as one of the famous 'Cambridge Seven' in the service of the China Inland Mission and served on the Tibetan border. During a trip from China to England, he stopped over in Los Angeles in early 1908 and was baptised in the Spirit. A year later, he played an important role in the formation of the Pentecostal Missionary Union for Great Britain and Ireland (PMU).⁷³ Yunnan province quickly became the PMU's major mission field. Its early recruits came not only from the United Kingdom, but also from the Netherlands and Denmark. The first four PMU men, as well as John Beruldsen and his two sisters, left for China in 1910.⁷⁴

The CIM missionary Hector McLean from Canada and Sigrid Bengtsson (1869-1935) of the Swedish Mission in China, a CIM affiliate mission, had entered their respective mission fields in China in 1901. Having married in 1905, the couple and their newborn daughter Karin Sarah travelled from Rangoon to England, Sweden, Canada and the United States in 1908. While staying at Dr. Finis E. Yoakum's Pisgah Home in Highland Park, California, they visited the Azusa Street Mission where they received the Pentecostal baptism in 1909. Having landed at Shanghai on 1 January 1910, the McLeans worked briefly in Shanghai and Shandong province (Yantai and Laiyang), before returning to Yunnan for service with the PMU. They retired in

⁷³ P.D. Hocken, "Cecil H. Polhill (1860-1938)", in Burgess and McGee (eds.), *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, p. 718. See also Hocken, "Cecil H. Polhill: Pentecostal Layman", *Pneuma* 10.1-2, (1988), pp. 116-140.

⁷⁴ For further details, see Anderson, *Spreading Fires*, pp. 123-130. Note that the Beruldsens, missionaries of the Tsjilimissionen, were also holding PMU certificates. See e.g. *Confidence* 5.6 (June 1912), p. 141.

1927 as independent Pentecostal missionaries and settled in Toronto.⁷⁵

John Daniel Fullerton (1883-) had arrived in Yunnan in 1912 as an Australian member of the China Inland Mission. When he received the baptism of the Spirit at a Pentecostal meeting in Kunming in 1914, he had to resign from the CIM. Having married Martha Rønager from Denmark, who had been sent to China by the Pentecostal Missionary Union, the couple established the small South Yunnan Mission in 1915. It received support from Pentecostals in Denmark.⁷⁶

A number of CMA missionaries who had already spent several years on the Gansu-Tibetan border also experienced Pentecostal phenomena. The stories of William Wallace Simpson (1869-1961) and Victor Guy Plymire (1881-1956) are well known and need not be retold here.⁷⁷ However, the Alliance missionaries Grace Caroline Agar (1877-1966) and Ivan Souder Kauffman (1885-1934) were also part of the Pentecostal revival in this part of China. The PMU evangelists Frank Trevitt and Amos Williams were present at the “special meetings” that “had been arranged for waiting on God for the Baptism into the Holy Spirit” by the local CMA missionaries at Taozhou (now called Lintan), Gansu province, in early May 1912. It was on this occasion that W. W. Simpson and his wife Otilia Ekvall (1869-1917) “were baptized into the Holy Spirit and Fire”.⁷⁸ Agar, who had arrived in China in 1902, had already gone on furlough to California prior to the Taozhou meetings. Upon “receiving the infilling of the Holy Spirit in 1912”, presumably while in the U.S., she too withdrew from the CMA and returned to China in 1914. She worked as an independent missionary in the PMU mission in Yunnan before receiving an appointment from the

⁷⁵ See Robeck, *Azusa Street Mission and Revival*, pp. 264-266; Anderson, *Spreading Fires*, p. 128. Further details can be found in Sigrid McLean, *Over Twenty Years in China* (Minneapolis: author, 1927). Their daughter continued to work as an independent Pentecostal missionary in Yunnan and Burma.

⁷⁶ John and Martha Fullerton, *Herrens Gerning i Syd Yunnan* (“Kirkeklokken”s Forlag, 1922).

⁷⁷ Bibliographic references are found in Gary B. McGee, “William Wallace Simpson”, in Stanley M. Burgess and Gary B. McGee (eds.), *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, Grand Rapids, Mich.: Zondervan, 1988, p. 787; G.W. Gohr, “Plymire, Victor Guy”, in *ibid.*, p. 718.

⁷⁸ A. Williams to A.A. Boddy, Taozhou (Old City), *Confidence* 5.7 (July 1912), p. 167. On Simpson and the early Pentecostal presence in south-western Gansu province, see also Anderson, *Spreading Fires*, pp. 130-133.

Assemblies of God in 1922.⁷⁹ Ivan Kauffman had been present at the Taozhou revival meetings in 1912 and separated from the CMA during his furlough in the U.S. in 1915. Having married Frances Jean Thompson in York, Ontario, in 1917, the couple set out for Taozhou in late 1917 with a certificate of fellowship from the General Council of the Assemblies of God. After a lengthy sojourn in the U.S. since 1920, they left once more for China in 1923, now representing the Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada in the coastal city of Qingdao.⁸⁰

The early Pentecostal missionaries in western China faced rather different conditions than those in the eastern part of the country. For one thing, in addition to Han Chinese settlers, they encountered various ethnic minorities. Moreover, these districts were quite remote, difficult to reach, with none of the modern amenities. The difficulty of travel to these distant stations is well illustrated by the experiences of the Kauffmans in 1917:

After days and weeks of hardships, testings and trials too deep for words, our brother, Ivan S. Kauffman and Mrs. Kauffman have reached their destination at Tao Chow (Old City) Kansu Prov., Northwest China. They journeyed in mid-winter with practically no heat, over mountains and dangerous precipices in ox-carts without springs, that jarred and upset, till their bodies could scarce stand the strain of the continuous jolting for weeks. Then changing to a mule litter they passed through a robber-infested region, but God showed His power and protection in a marked way.⁸¹

It was reported that Mrs. Kauffman, who was coming out to China for the first time, “was brought to death’s door as a result of a long and very severe journey”.⁸² Indeed, without the presence of several

⁷⁹ “Missionary Heroine with the Lord”, *The Pentecostal Evangel* (12 March 1967), p. 28. Her life and ministry is told in Inez Spence, *Dark Is This Land: Grace Agar* (Springfield, Mo.: Foreign Missions Dept., Assemblies of God, [1962?]).

⁸⁰ For a biographical account, see Donald H. Kauffman, *The Cross and the Dragon* (Young America, Minn.; Toronto: Little Ones Books, [1994?]).

⁸¹ *The Latter Rain Evangel* (April 1918), p. 14.

⁸² *The Weekly Evangel* #233 (30 March 1918), p. 16.

experienced men and women who had formerly been members of the CIM or CMA missions in Yunnan and Gansu, life would have been even harder for the pioneering newcomers. As a consequence of this continuity in the missionary endeavour, the foundations were laid for the expanding evangelistic work that developed afterwards.

Emergence of Organizational Structures

The early years of the Pentecostal missionary enterprise were relatively unstable. As has already been discussed, in the first wave of eager evangelists to arrive in China were those individual 'faith' missionaries who had come on the spur of the moment. Disillusionment quickly crept in because of the harsh realities they had to face, their inability to communicate with the people, financial instability and lack of preparation. Disease, illness and death also curtailed missionary careers. Some faith workers returned to their homeland after only a brief spell in the East, prompting one writer to call these restless spirits "traveling, sight-seeing experimenting missionaries, who expect to make a trip around the world and come home".⁸³ McIntosh and Garr were not the only ones who found it difficult to settle down. Mrs. Kirby, Mabel Evans and Fannie Winn did not spend much time in China either, sojourning briefly in Palestine before returning to the U.S. in early 1909.⁸⁴ George W. Cram and his wife left for the United States because they could not cope with the Chinese language.⁸⁵

Inadequate financial support caused others to return to the homeland. Note, for instance, the case of Rosa Pittman and her husband Edward Christon Downing, a former Japan missionary. According to Drusie Malott, "Brother and Sister Downing, who have had to leave Hong Kong, because some one at home has not had them on their heart, to pray down the means to enable them to live and carry on the work

⁸³ E[udorus] N. Bell, "A Word to Foreign Missionaries", *Word and Witness* (20 October 1912), p. 3.

⁸⁴ Note from A.E. Kirby, Jerusalem, 19 October 1908, *The Bridegroom's Messenger* 2.26 (15 November 1908), p. 1. The trio arrived in New York on 8 February 1909. Their return may have been occasioned by the death of Kirby's elderly husband Daniel Kirby in South Carolina on 6 November 1908. They had married in 1881 when Annie was 19 and the widower Daniel 51.

⁸⁵ The Crams landed in San Francisco in September 1909. In 1930 George Cram was still listed as a Pentecostal minister in Pasadena.

there at Hong Kong, have gone to live with Mr. and Mrs. Rushin.”⁸⁶ The Downings left China for good in 1916, arriving in Vancouver from Hongkong on 20 November 1916. The 1920 census shows them in Lynden, Washington, with Edward Downing as a Baptist Church minister. The Rushins, too, found life difficult at this time. When funding from Baptist sources was no longer forthcoming, they turned to the Church of God (Cleveland, Tennessee) for support. From late 1915 until 1925, letters and reports from Jennie Brinson Rushin appeared regularly in the Church of God organ, the *Church of God Evangel*.⁸⁷

Then there were those who abandoned their Pentecostal convictions altogether. It has not been possible to establish this for Thomas Junk. The last known letter from him to Pentecostal periodicals was published in the July 1911 issue of *The Latter Rain Evangel*. However, his subsequent passport applications indicate that Junk remained in China, but was involved in various commercial activities in Shandong province. In his applications from 1918 onward he is desperately trying to hide his German origins by claiming that he was born in Denmark. The last passport application accessible on the internet dates from 1923. There may, of course, be later applications in the relevant files at the National Archives in College Park, Maryland, but it has not yet been possible to search for them. No evidence has come to light that he ever returned to the United States. In other words, Thomas Junk simply vanishes.

Of course, several of the early Pentecostal evangelists persevered and served for many years in China. Although little is known about Elen Søyland, she is still listed at Pingding, Shanxi, in the 1936 *Directory of Protestant Missions in China*. Maria Björkman was working in Hebei province as late as 1940. Emma Lawler and her daughter E. Beatrice Lawler pursued their missionary careers in China until 1951, whereas her husband Homer and her son Harland were only intermittently involved in evangelization and in later years had taken up mercantile activities in Shanghai. These examples remind us that even in the early years of the evangelistic endeavour in China, women — single, married or widowed — represented the majority of the Pentecostal workers.

In time, as the missionary enterprise expanded, some Pentecostal

⁸⁶ *The Bridegroom's Messenger* (1 August 1916), p. 3.

⁸⁷ According to China Coast directories and passenger lists, the Rushins, now operating under the surname McNair, were living in Shanghai in the 1930s but do not seem to have undertaken any missionary work.

leaders began to advocate the creation of at least rudimentary organizational forms. Although many Pentecostals resisted the formation of institutional structures beyond local fellowships, wider denominational formations nevertheless took shape in Europe and North America. In China, many missionaries became aligned with one or other of these emerging denominational organizations.

Several smaller organizations from a Holiness background were already in existence in the southeastern United States. In addition to the Pentecostal Holiness Church of North Carolina, two other early Pentecostal churches with whom it would merge into what is now the International Pentecostal Holiness Church supported missionaries in China. The Holiness Church of North Carolina, under the ministry of Gaston Barnabas Cashwell (1862-1916), came under the influence of the Azusa Street revival of 1906. Consequently, Pentecostal doctrine was accepted and, in 1909, the church changed its name to Pentecostal Holiness Church. It had already established a 'missionary board' at its Fayetteville, North Carolina, convention in 1904. When Eliza May Law returned from furlough in the United States in 1912, she brought back with her Miss Olive ("Ollie") Eugene Maw (1889-1959), of South Carolina and a member of the original Pentecostal Holiness Church.⁸⁸ The Fire-Baptized Holiness Church (火洗聖潔會), led by Joseph Hillery King (1869-1946) since 1900, became in 1908 the first denomination to officially embrace Pentecostalism. Widowed Mrs. Addell Harrison (1874-1946) and her young daughter Golden (1898-1947) were in Hongkong for the Fire-Baptized Holiness Church from 1910.⁸⁹ In 1911, this church merged into the Pentecostal Holiness Church. In 1915, the small Tabernacle Pentecostal Church, founded by Nickles John Holmes (1847-1919), also merged with the Pentecostal Holiness Church. At the time of the merger, it supported the work of three women in China. The first of them was Anna Maria Deane who had arrived in December 1909 to minister in Hongkong and South

⁸⁸ George Floyd Taylor, "Our Church History: Chapter XI", *Pentecostal Holiness Advocate* (7 April 1921), p. 8; mentioned in Hunter, "Centennial Notes", endnote 75. Miss Law joined the Pentecostal Holiness Church in 1910. Hunter adds that she later adopted the 'finished work' theory and 'the one name baptism'.

⁸⁹ Addell Harrison's passport application in 1919 includes a letter from the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World, dated Indianapolis, 17 March 1919, to the effect that she was going to China as a missionary "under the directions of the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World".

China. She was joined by her niece Anna Deane Cole (1892-) in 1912 and by Jane Axtell Schermerhorn (1861-1938) in 1914. As a result of the successive mergers, a General Missions Board of the Pentecostal Holiness Church was established in 1915 for the purpose of candidate examination and distribution of funds to the missionaries. Notable missionaries to China of the Pentecostal Holiness Church after consolidation include William Henry Turner and his wife Orine Aquilla Entrekin [also called Aquilla Orine Entrekin] who arrived in 1919.⁹⁰ It should also be noted that Cecil Polhill and others founded the first successful Pentecostal missions agency, the Pentecostal Missionary Union in the United Kingdom in 1909.

When the General Council of the Assemblies of God was formed in 1914, a substantial number of American missionaries affiliated with that organization, making it the largest Pentecostal missionary body in China. However, doctrinal issues led to the formation of a major rival organization in the United States, namely the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World (PAW) that had been established in 1911 as an interracial church. In 1915, the 'New Issue', including baptism in Jesus' name and adherence to Oneness 'new birth' teaching, was adopted. In 1918, the organization was reinforced by dissidents who had been ousted by the Assemblies of God in 1916 during the 'Jesus Only' controversy. However, in 1924 the PAW itself became divided by the withdrawal of many of the Southern White members into three distinct new bodies that, as a result of subsequent mergers, in 1945 became the United Pentecostal Church.⁹¹

In China, three early missionaries can be identified with an explicit affiliation with the PAW. Frank Staples Ramsey and his wife Sophie Eleanor, as well as twenty-year-old Elizabeth Stieglitz (1889-1975) had left St. Paul, Minnesota, in 1910 to establish a mission station at Datong, Shanxi province. Having come upon a portion of Frank Ewart's *Meat in Due Season* in late 1914, they decided to adopt the Oneness theology.⁹² In other instances, the nature of affiliation is rather

⁹⁰ Turner, W[illiam] H[enry], *Pioneering in China* (Franklin Springs, GA: Publishing House of the PHC, 1928).

⁹¹ On the racial, doctrinal and personal issues causing divisions in early Pentecostalism, see Anderson, *Introduction to Pentecostalism*, pp. 45, 49-50.

⁹² Nona Freeman, "The Story of Elizabeth Stieglitz", in: Mary H. Wallace (comp.), *Profiles of Pentecostal Missionaries* (Hazelwood, Mo.: Word Aflame Press, 1986), p. 328.

difficult to determine. Among the missionaries who received support from the PAW in the years 1914-1915 are, for example, the Anglins, George Hansen and Frank Denney. Addell Harrison and Phoebe Holmes, both of whom had come to China in 1910, as well as Olive E. Maw were later also “under the directives of the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World”.⁹³ George M. Kelley, whose relations with his fellow Assemblies of God workers were rather strained, is also mentioned.⁹⁴ Here we should keep in mind Cecil Robeck’s conclusion that “Denominational loyalties were lightly held in those days, especially in Holiness and Pentecostal circles.”⁹⁵

Bernt Berntsen is no longer mentioned in the principal Pentecostal periodical publications after 1916. The reason for this probably has to do with his opting for Oneness Pentecostalism. Thus, when his son Henry Bernhard Berntsen (1900-1976) married Helga Nathalia Hansen (daughter of George and Sofie Hansen) in 1920, Bernt Berntsen was authorized by the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World to perform the ceremony.⁹⁶ Yet he also seems to have become affiliated with the Church of God (Adventist), a ramification of the Millerite movement. This connection was first mentioned in Church of God sources in 1916, according to which Elder “Bernstein” supervised a “Church of God” in Beijing. This must be the Church of God Faith Mission listed in the *Peking Who’s Who* of 1922.⁹⁷ Interestingly, his passport application of

⁹³ See the 1917 passport application for Phoebe Holmes, with the supporting letter from PAW, Indianapolis, 3 October 1917. Note also that the PAW letterhead has George Hansen and Frank Denney serving as ‘foreign field missionary superintendents’. Upon her marriage to Clinton Edwin Finch in January 1920, Olive E. Maw became associated with the Assemblies of God mission in South China.

⁹⁴ For these and other names, see Daniel L. Scott, *The Evolving World of Foreign Missions*. A comprehensive history of the Foreign Missions Division of the United Pentecostal Church International. Book in PDF format on CD (Copyright 2009), Chapter 2: The Early Years of Foreign Missions.

⁹⁵ C. M. Robeck, Jr., “Aimee Semple McPherson”, in: Burgess and McGee (eds.), *Dictionary of Pentecostal and Charismatic Movements*, p. 569.

⁹⁶ *Consular Reports of Marriage, 1910–1949. Records of the Department of State*, Record Group Number: 59; Microfilm Serial: A1, Entry 3001; Microfilm Roll: 480, File Number: 133/1502, Beijing; National Archives and Records Administration (NARA), Washington, D.C.

⁹⁷ See the *Peking Who’s Who 1922*, p. 52, where his name is given as “D. Berntsen”.

25 August 1919, lists both the Pentecostal Assemblies of the World and the Church of God.⁹⁸ Berntsen's Chinese Pentecostal periodical, *Tongzhuān fūyīn zhēnlǐbào* [Popular Gospel Truth], likewise carried articles both on Oneness Pentecostalism⁹⁹ and sabbatarian observances¹⁰⁰.

His periodical also indicates that he moved from Zhengding to Beijing after 1916. The earliest extant number (1914) was published by the *Xinxinhui* [Faith Mission] of Zhengding county. The April 1919 number is the first one to be published by Berntsen in Beijing for the *Zhēnshēnjiào Xinxinhui* [Teachings of the True God Faith Mission]. In the next issue, the name has been changed to *Shēnjiāohuì* [Church of God]. It is not known whether he visited the Zhengding work in the 1920s. This would have been a relatively simple journey by train along the Beijing-Hankou line. At any rate, no further references to Berntsen's missionary activities have been found in the accessible records, except for a notice in 1933 in which his name ("Bernsten") appears on the list the "seventy to go forth two by two, all Church of God elders".¹⁰¹ Berntsen died in 1933 and his wife passed away two years later. It was their daughter Ruth Esther (1910-1947) who continued the work at Zhengding in the 1930s, evidently in the Oneness tradition. At any rate, in the summer of 1946 extracts of a letter she had received from Zhang Yingxi — who had been trained by Bernt

⁹⁸ National Archives and Records Administration (NARA), Washington D.C.; Passport Applications, January 2, 1906 - March 31, 1925; ARC Identifier 583830 / MLR Number A1 534; NARA Series: M1490; Roll #887.

⁹⁹ *Tongzhuān fūyīn zhēnlǐbào*, (May 1916), p. 4. I would like to thank Darrin Rodgers, Director of the Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, for informing me that this periodical is now accessible online: [http://ifphc.org/DigitalPublications/China/Independent/Popular Gospel Truth/](http://ifphc.org/DigitalPublications/China/Independent/Popular%20Gospel%20Truth/)

¹⁰⁰ *Ibid.*, (June 1916), p. 1; (March 1918), p. 7. It is possible that Swedish-born Erik Pilquist introduced Berntsen to Adventist ideas. Having come to China in 1891 as a member of the Scandinavian Alliance Mission, Pilquist subsequently had dealings with the Seventh-Day Adventists and lived for a time in Beijing as an independent missionary. He visited Zhengding in 1917 and verified Berntsen's identity for the latter's 1917 passport application.

¹⁰¹ See Richard C. Nickels, *History of the Seventh Day Church of God*, Chapters IX-X; online URL: <http://www.giveshare.org/churchhistory/historysdcof/history9.html> and [.../history10.html](http://www.giveshare.org/churchhistory/historysdcof/history10.html). In 1923 the organisation's name was changed from Church of God (Adventist) to Church of God (Seventh Day).

Berntsen and had subsequently taken charge of the work in China — were published in *The Pentecostal Herald*, the official publication of the United Pentecostal Church.¹⁰²

It is not always easy to identify organizational affiliations, especially with regard to societies whose records have not survived and whose involvement in China was minimal. According to the directories of Protestant missions in China, in the 1930s Emma and Beatrice Lawler were in charge of the Emmanuel Church of the Foursquare Gospel in Shanghai, with the support of Aimee Semple McPherson's International Church of the Foursquare Gospel.¹⁰³ It is not known when Francis (“Frank”) John Casley’s United Free Gospel Mission first supported missionaries in China. However, according to her 1918 U.S. passport application, Mrs Lizzie Matilda Johnson (1872-1964) was a missionary of that organization while at Baina [Paknai], Guangdong. She had arrived in China in 1910 as an independent Pentecostal missionary. However, for many other Pentecostal missionaries it has not been possible to establish any kind of organizational link. In any case, the anti-organizational sentiment among missionaries remained strong. A good number continued to operate as ‘Pentecostal Missionaries’ or simply as ‘independent’ workers. Because they preferred independence, these individuals have largely eluded the historian’s attention.

The Emergence of a Chinese Church

None of the missionary endeavours — whether Pentecostal or otherwise — could have succeeded without the active support of Chinese workers. The early involvement of Mok Lai Chi in Hongkong is a striking example. While references to the native evangelists are scattered throughout the extant Pentecostal periodical literature, there is as yet no comprehensive and systematic study of the relationship between foreign missionaries and indigenous agency. What evangelization methods were employed? What can be learned from an analysis of the extent to which Pentecostal practices and beliefs resonated with those of Chinese folk religion or the beliefs and practices of the various ethnic minorities among whom many

¹⁰² Ruth E. Redmon [nee Berntsen], letter in *The Pentecostal Herald* 21.8 (August 1946), p. 8.

¹⁰³ *1936 Handbook of the Christian Movement in China Under Protestant Auspices* (Shanghai: National Christian Council of China, 1936), pp. 120-121.

Pentecostals evangelized? A strong belief in supernaturalism, including divine healing, visions, ecstatic worship, miraculous events and speaking in tongues were not unknown in China. Finally, there are no statistical records that show the number and geographical distribution of converts. In other words, concrete evidence concerning the overall achievement of the Pentecostal missionary enterprise is lacking.

On the other hand, considerable progress has been made in the study of Chinese independent Christianity. In this regard, Lian Xi's recent monograph, *Redeemed by Fire*, makes a major contribution. The chapters "The Lightning out of the East: The True Jesus Church", and "The Jesus Family" are particularly relevant and enlightening.¹⁰⁴ Further research has established that the origins of the True Jesus Church are to be found in the encounters between its founder, Wei Enbo, and Bernt Berntsen in Beijing. As is stated in the August 1916 issue of Berntsen's Chinese newsletter, *Popular Gospel Truth*, Wei was baptized in the Spirit in Beijing on 12 December 1915. It is highly likely that these encounters had a bearing on the presence of Oneness Pentecostal and sabbatarian elements in the True Jesus Church, which is now one of the largest Protestant churches in China and beyond.

The Jesus Family (*Yesu jiating*) was a unique Pentecostal communitarian church first established in the vicinity of Tai'an, Shandong, ca. 1927. In later years, other Jesus Family churches emerged in North and Central China. They were all in rural or semirural areas, and were formed into small communities of up to a few hundred, with the believers working and living together, and holding property in common. The Pentecostal influence has been attributed to Jing Dianying's contact with Leslie M. Anglin's Home of Onesiphorus mission commune at Tai'an. It also inspired the Jesus Family's egalitarian communalism.¹⁰⁵

Conclusion

A number of Pentecostal missionaries, driven by end-time fervour

¹⁰⁴ Lian Xi, *Redeemed by Fire: The Rise of Popular Christianity in Modern China* (New Haven & London: Yale University Press, 2010).

¹⁰⁵ In addition to Lian's monograph chapter, see also Tao Feiya, *Zhongguo de Jidujiao wutuobang: Yesu jiating* [A Christian Utopia in China: the Jesus Family (1921-1952)], (Hongkong: Xianggang Zhongwen daxue, 2004); Daniel H. Bays (ed.), *Christianity in China: From the Eighteenth Century to the Present* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1996), p. 312.

and eager to spread the good news in foreign parts, made their way to China in the wake of the great Azusa Street Revival. For many the early years were difficult and some did not stay for long. It was only after organizational structures were introduced that an enduring and stable Pentecostal missionary enterprise emerged. Especially for the early period of Pentecostal missions, with the strong opposition among the faithful and their leaders to the setting up of central bureaucratic structures, there is a distinct paucity of archival material. Historians have to rely to a large extent on the accessible but limited Pentecostal periodical literature to reconstruct the missionary presence in China. It is, nevertheless, hoped that at least some of these intrepid evangelists will have been retrieved from that obscurity which has engulfed the great majority of ordinary folk.

PENTECOSTAL MISSIONS IN CHINA

Name (with Chinese Name)	Nationality	China Start	Locations in China (province)	Comments
Adullam Rescue Mission (ARM)	American	1919	Yunnan	Started by former Disciples of Christ missionaries H.A. Baker and wife
Apostolic Church-Missionary Movement <i>Shitu hui</i>	International	1923	Hebei; Guizhou	Begun by Dagny Pedersen from Denmark
Apostolic Faith Mission (AFM) <i>Shitu xinxin hui</i>	Canadian		Jiangsu	No concrete data has come to light concerning this mission; see also Pacific Coast Missionary Society
Assemblies of God (AG) <i>Shangdi jiaohui;</i> <i>Shenzhao hui</i>	American	1914	Gansu; Zhili/Hebei; Shanxi; Shandong; Guangdong; Guangxi; Hongkong	Several of the AG missionaries had been in China as independent workers prior to 1914
Assembly of God – Good News Mission <i>Shenzhao hui</i>	American	1915	Hebei	Started by Abraham Lovalien Heidal and his wife

Church of God (Cleveland, Tennessee) <i>Zhen shenjiao hui</i>	American	1923	Shandong	Jennie Brinson Rushin, who arrived in Shandong in 1914, had already received some support in 1915
Dutch Pentecostal Missionary Society	Dutch	1921	Yunnan	Before 1920 they were members of the PMU; ceased in 1931
Emmanuel Church of the Foursquare Gospel (ECFG); <i>Wanguo sifang fuyihui</i>	American		Jiangsu; Shandong	Associated with the International Church of the Foursquare Gospel
Emmanuel Full Gospel Mission	Swedish/American		Shandong	A small mission at Longshan, run by Olof Sigrid Ferm and his American wife Pauline Louise Gleim
Finnish Free Foreign Mission (FFFM) (not to be confused with the Finnish Free Missionary Society a.k.a. Free Church of Finland Mission)	Finnish	1927	Manchuria	Closed down in 1929 on account of opposition from local Finnish Pentecostal churches intent on preserving their autonomy; see Saalem Mission
Finnish Pentecostal Friends Mission	Finnish	1924	Shandong	China work ceased in 1927
Free Church of Sweden (FCS) <i>Ruidian zilihui</i>	Swedish	1907	Zhili/Hebei (FCS); Yunnan (SFM)	Operated in Yunnan under the name 'Swedish Free Mission' (<i>Ruidian shenzhao hui</i>) from 1922
Free Evangelical Assemblies of Norway (FEFM); <i>De Frie Evangeliske Forsamlings Misjon</i>	Norwegian	1916	Zhili/Hebei; Shanxi	Established by Erik Andersen Nordquelle (1858-1938) and his 'De frie venner' congregation in Kristiania (Oslo)
Home of Onesiphorus	American	1916	Shandong	Founded by L. M. Anglin and wife

Home of the Nazarene (HN)	Canadian?	1908	Jiangsu	An independent work with subsequent Pentecostal connections
Norway's Free Evangelical Mission to the Heathen (NFEM); <i>Nuowei fuyihui</i>	Norwegian	1916	Zhili/Chahar	Many of its early missionaries had originally gone to China with the Norwegian Mission Alliance (at the time called 'Tsjilimisjonen'). After the NFEM was dissolved in 1934, its missionaries continued to Operate independently under the label 'Norwegian Evangelical Mission', supported individually by local Norwegian and U.S. assemblies.
Pacific Coast Missionary Society (PCMS) <i>Taipingyang budaohui</i>	Canadian	1913	Zhejiang	Merged with PAC in 1942
Pai Hsiang Mission (PHM) <i>Shenhou hui</i> 神后會	Norwegian	1922	Baixian, Hebei	Run by Jens Fjeld, since 1920 in China with FEFM
Pentecostal Assemblies of Canada (PAC) <i>Jia'nada shenzhao hui</i>	Canadian	1914	Guangdong; Hongkong	
Pentecostal Assemblies of the World (PAW); <i>Shenzhao hui fuyintang</i>	American	1915	Shanxi; Guangdong	Several independent missionaries in China began to receive support in 1914. It is not known whether the was continued

				PAW support after the white members left and started their own denomination
Pentecostal Church of God in America (PCG)	American	after 1933		George Hickson Doyal, in Hongkong since 1916, was the PCG's first missionary to China
Pentecostal Holiness Mission (PHM) <i>Shenzhao hui</i>	American	1907	Hongkong; Guangdong	
Pentecostal Missionary Union (PMU) <i>Ying wuxunhui</i>	British	1912	Yunnan	
Pittsburgh Bible Institute (PBI) <i>Pisibao shengjing xuejiao chahui</i>	American	1922	Sichun	
Saalem Mission <i>Saleng hui</i>	Finnish	1929	Jilin	The Finnish Free Foreign Missions having been dissolved by local Finnish Pentecostal churches, Helsinki's Saalem Church set up its own mission board.
South Yunnan Mission (SYM) <i>Nan-Yunnan hui</i>	Danish	1915	Yunnan	Started by former CIM missionary John D. Fullerton and his Danish wife Martha Rönager, formerly PMU
Swedish Free Mission (SFM)				see Free Church of Sweden
United Free Gospel Mission (UFGM)	American		Guangdong	Founded in 1916 by Frank Casley in Pennsylvania

United Pentecostal Church (UPC), a merger of the Pentecostal Church, Incorporated (PCI) and the Pentecostal Assemblies of Jesus Christ (PAJC)	American	1924	Guangdong; Shanxi	UPC came into being in 1945 as the result of a sequence of splits and mergers since 1924, following the withdrawal of white members from PAW
Vereinigte Missionsfreunde (VMF)	German	1931	Yunnan	Took over the work started by Dutch Pentecostals

Note: Although the Tsechow Mission, founded by Stanley Peregrine Smith (1861-1931), and Anna Cheng's Mission, named after Anna Sofie Jacobsen (1860-1911), had 'Pentecostal episodes', they have not been included in this table.