"RENEWING THE PENTECOSTAL VISION AND WITNESS OF THE JUSTIFIED PEOPLE OF GOD"¹

By Monte Lee Rice

Introduction

Beginning on Wall Street in New York City and spreading to more than 80 nations worldwide, the "Occupy" movement was a key iconic trend defining the year 2011. Branding itself as "the 99 per cent," the movement has protested against a grossly disparate socialeconomic wealth divide. I believe these are cries for a more just world order. Therefore, may God indeed raise us up to the high paths of compassion, mercy and justice. With this in mind, I argue in this paper that integral to global Pentecostalism as an ecclesiological tradition and Christian spirituality is a vision of God's justice and witness as the justified people of God. When the Spirit renews this vision in us, our ecclesial life should evidence the coming together of diverse socialeconomic, generational, and ethnically stratified peoples into heterogeneous communities. In this manner, we witness to God's reign as proleptic signs to His healing for all creation.

However, the consumerist vision for human life that is attendant to 21st century market forces challenges the integrity of Pentecostalism/s, as they engage globalization. Further triggering this risk is the Pentecostal "indigenizing" impulse, which prompts global Pentecostal streams to hybridize through engagement with globalization. Pentecostalism/s therefore risks fragmenting into "spiritualities" no longer reflecting a viably embodied vision and witness as God's justified people. I therefore propose a renewing of the Pentecostal social vision and witness as God's justified people, in a

¹This paper was originally presented at the 41st Annual Meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies on February 29-March 3, 2012, at Regent University in Virginia Beach, Virginia, USA.

manner that is faithfully responsive to 21st century challenges of a market and consumerist-driven world order. I suggest we inform the ongoing maturation of a Pentecostal ecclesiology and spirituality with a stronger social theology of justification. This infers our witness as inclusive-reaching, heterogeneous communities with the aim of empowering the weak and marginalized to a just fellowship and shared voice within present and emerging expressions of God's shalom.

Part One: Historical Precedence and Current Challenges

Early Pentecostal Inclusivism and Social-Economic Empowerment

I shall begin by recalling the early Pentecostal vision for congregational inclusivism and its role in "social-economic" empowerment in Pentecostal spirituality. In doing so, I suggest that this vision is integral to Pentecostal giftedness. I thus affirm Walter Hollenweger's thesis that Pentecostal outpourings during the first "ten years" of the 20th century impregnated Pentecostal spirituality with paradigmatic trajectories for its ongoing maturation as a communally gifted, Christian tradition and spirituality.² While running the risk of appearing privy to past western hegemony over Pentecostal historiography, which ignored the global polycentric origins of Pentecostalism, I find reasonable grounds for privileging the Azusa Street Revival as a core framing-story for 21st century global Pentecostalism. Historiographies that have privileged the Azusa Street Revival, if only on grounds of its "mythological" relation to world Pentecostalism, often note its symbolic power to resonate with socialeconomically marginalized peoples worldwide.³ I believe the Azusa story helps us envision Pentecostal outpourings as God's blessing for bringing people of different social strata together, often leading to social-economic uplift.⁴

²Walter J. Hollenweger, *The Pentecostals* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1988), 251; Steven J. Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality: A Passion for the Kingdom* (Sheffield, UK: Sheffield Academic Press, Journal of Pentecostal Theology Supplement Series 1, 1993; Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2010), 1, 14, 37.

³Stephen J. Hunt, "Deprivation and Western Pentecostalism Revisited: The Case of 'Classical' Pentecostalism," *PentecoStudiesOnline, Journal for the Interdisciplinary Study of Pentecostalism and Charismatic Movements*, no. 1 (2002) Available: http://www.glopent.net/pentecostudies/2002/hunt2002-1.pdf/view [29 December 2011], 1, 6, 8.

⁴Allan H. Anderson, *An Introduction to Pentecostalism: Global Charismatic Christianity* (Cambridge, UK: Cambridge University Press, 2004), 45.

Two important dynamics arising from the Azusa testimony of inclusiveness and social-economic empowerment are the democratizing power of oral-driven liturgy and defining the mark of Spirit baptism as social reconciliation, often liturgically signified through the congregational practice of tongues speech. Hollenweger argued that Pentecostal orality nurtures "a form of community that is reconciliatory."⁵ While print-driven liturgies may better ensure doctrinal and performative correctness, Pentecostal orality has demonstrated a socially revolutionary power by empowering all social-economic strata into full vocalized participation within the gathered community.⁶ Within this oral liturgy, tongues speech has particularly played a "democratizing" function, signifying that the Holy Spirit is dismantling prevailing segregating norms by raising up a socially inclusive leadership and charismatic fellowship.⁷

This "oral-participatory" ecclesiology thus presumes a democratizing of the Spirit's prophetic anointing, as we recognise God is pouring out His Spirit "upon all flesh."⁸ There is still however, much to recover from William Seymour's "reconciling" theology of Spirit baptism, and much to rectify from the ideological role which "evidential" phraseology has played in demarking boundaries on Pentecostal identity worldwide.⁹ Some have therefore proposed a "sign" approach to tongues speech, which may better identify its true social-ethical-theological ramifications signifying the "breaking down of walls between diverse peoples," and joining them together as God's new people.¹⁰

⁵Hollenweger, *Pentecostalism: Origins and Developments Worldwide* (Peabody, MA: Hendrickson, 1997), 18.

⁶Hollenweger, *Pentecostalism*, 23-24, 35, 269-275; esp. 273.

⁷Dale T. Irvin, "Drawing All Together in One Bond of Love': The Ecumenical Vision of William J. Seymour and the Azusa Street Revival," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 6 (1995): 25-53 (25-26); Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen, "Culture, Contextualization, and Conversion': Missiological Reflections from the Catholic-Pentecostal Dialogue (1990-1997)," *Journal of Asian Mission*, no. 2 (September 2000): 261-275 (273).

⁸Kärkkäinen, "Truth on Fire: Pentecostal Theology of Mission and the Challenges of a New Millennium," *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 3, no. 1 (January 2000): 38.

⁹Hollenweger, *Pentecostalism*, 23; Cecil M. Robeck, Jr., "Pentecostal Origins in Global Perspective," in *All Together in One Place: Theological Papers from the Brighton Conference on World Evangelization*, eds. Harold D. Hunter and Peter D. Hocken (Sheffield, UK: Sheffield Academic Press, 1993), 167.

¹⁰Hollenweger, *Pentecostalism*, 23; Frank D. Macchia proposes shifting from evidentialist language to "sign" oriented phraseology, to better capture the theological ramifications arising from the symbolic imagery of tongues speech; "Groans too Deep for Words': Towards a Theology of Tongues as Initial Evidence," *Asian Journal of Pentecostal Studies* 1, no. 2 (July 1998): 149-173 (152-153, 172-173).

Globalization, Global Market Spirituality, Pentecostal Fragmentation

Global Pentecostalism has positively engaged the global market economy in manners demonstrating the socially redemptive fruit of Pentecostal spirituality. In his analysis on Pentecostalism and the "global market economy," Amos Yong notes that Pentecostal networks, especially in the Southern Hemisphere, have enabled Pentecostals to thrive within the global market economy, leading to "upward socio-economic mobility," while also aiding local socialeconomic prosperity.¹¹ Nonetheless, a critical challenge facing Christianity today is the formative power of 21st century global market forces along with their consumerist vision for human life. Thoughtful critiques have discerned a spirituality operative through global market forces, which comprises an identity-forming story-world. This storyworld defines human identity according to consumption of brands, goods, and services. Unfortunately, Christians may fail to recognize the market's formative power to "disciple" us in manners most conducive for its own interests. This may be evident in church growth strategies emphasizing cultural relevancy and need-centered, niche marketing.¹² Synergism to the consumerist spirituality of current global market forces may be evident when churches seek congregational expressions of socio-economic homogeneity in order to reach higher socialeconomic strata within a given locality.¹³

The spirituality of consumerism may be particularly evident whenever Pentecostals divide along social-economic lines, especially when prosperous Pentecostals loosen contact with less prosperous Pentecostals.¹⁴ Another symptom may be diminishing liturgical expressions of Pentecostal orality, in order to gain upper middle class Evangelical respectability.¹⁵ Further triggering this risk is the

¹¹Amos Yong, *In the Days of Caesar: Pentecostalism and Political Theology* (Grand Rapids, MI; Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans, 2010), 15-26.

¹²James K. A. Smith, *Who's Afraid of Postmodernism? Taking Derrida, Lyotard, and Foucault to Church* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Academic, 2006), 103-107.

¹³Craig Van Gelder, *The Ministry of the Missional Church: A Community Led by the Spirit* (Grand Rapids, MI: BakerBooks, 2007), 42.

¹⁴Anderson, "Introduction: World Pentecostalism at a Crossroads," in *Pentecostals after a Century: Global Perspectives on a Movement in Transition*, eds. Allan H. Anderson, and Walter J. Hollenweger (Sheffield, UK: Sheffield Academic Press, 1999), 28-29; Hollenweger, "Crucial Issues for Pentecostals," in *Pentecostals after a Century*, 188-189. ¹⁵Gary B. McGee, "More than Evangelical': The Challenge of the Evolving Theological Identity of the Assemblies of God," *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostals*.

Pentecostal "indigenizing" impulse, which prompts Pentecostal streams to hybridize as they engage globalization and globalized networks.¹⁶ While nurturing the *forming (formanda)* of "Pentecostalisms" within new contexts, the cost however may be a weakened prophetic consciousness, given Pentecostal pragmatism and ambivalence towards theological and philosophical reflection.¹⁷

Experiential Versus Confessional Understanding of Pentecostalism/s

This analysis leads me to counter Allan Anderson's thesis, reflecting a highly inclusive defining of Pentecostalism according to its nuance on invasive experiences with the Holy Spirit that Pentecostalism's "contextual pneumatology" will insure continued 21st century vitality.¹⁸ Relevant is James Smith's five descriptives of a "pentecostal worldview;" "radical openness to God;" 'enchanted' theology of creation and culture;" "nondulasitic affirmation of embodiment and materiality;" "affective, narrative epistemology" and "eschatological orientation to mission and justice."¹⁹ I surmise however, that we may discern in varied degrees the first four descriptives within postmodern spirituality. Therefore, I argue for a more theological and confessional approach to defining Pentecostalism/s, which suggests a moral-ethical-prophetic trajectory, integral to the communal calling and giftedness of Pentecostalism as an ecclesiological tradition and Christian spirituality.²⁰

Studies 25, no. 2 (Fall 2003): 289-300 (296); Scott A. Ellington, "The Costly Loss of Testimony," Journal of Pentecostal Theology (2000): 48-59 (53-54, 59).

¹⁶Michael Wilkinson, "What's 'Global about Global Pentecostalism?" *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 17 (2008): 96-109 (107-109); See: Irvin, "Pentecostal Historiography and Global Christianity: Rethinking the Question of Origins," *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 27, no. 1 (Spring 2005): 35-50 (45).

¹⁷Byron D. Klaus, "The Holy Spirit and Mission in Eschatological Perspective: A Pentecostal Viewpoint," *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 27, no. 2 (Fall 2005): 322-342 (342).

¹⁸Anderson, An Introduction to Pentecostalism, 14, 285-286.

¹⁹Smith, *Thinking in Tongues: Pentecostal Contributions to Christian Philosophy* (Grand Rapids, MI; Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans, 2010), 12, 44-46.

²⁰I am thus following through with: John Christopher Thomas, "Pentecostal Theology in the Twenty-First Century," *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* 20, no. 1 (Spring 1998): 3-19 (12, 17-19); idem, "Introduction," in *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel*, ed. John Christopher Thomas (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2010), 5-6. For relevant discussions see: Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality*, 133-135; Murray W. Dempster, "The Structure of a Christian Ethic Informed by Pentecostal Experience: Soundings in the Moral Significance of Glossolalia," in *The Spirit and Spirituality: Essays* in *Honour of Russell P. Spittler*, eds. Wonsuk Ma and

Part Two: Applying the Social Orientation of Justification to Pentecostal Ecclesiology

N.T. Wright's "Fresh" Perspective on Paul's Theology of Justification

If we are to faithfully negotiate the challenges of a market and consumerist-driven world order, while also helping believers prosper within this order, we must counter its false identity-forming scripts for human actualization by demonstrating through the power of the Holy Spirit the full spiritual and socially redemptive vision of Jesus as Savior, Sanctifier, Baptizer, Healer and Coming King. I believe that a stronger social orientation of justification can provide us a timely help towards this direction. I therefore place at the foundation of this proposal, N.T. Wright's "'fresh'/'new' perspective" on Paul's theology of justification.

Rather than understanding Paul's polemics against Judaism in Pelagian terms (works-righteousness), Wright argues Paul was rather primarily concerned with how God would show himself faithful to His Abrahamic covenant-promise for Israel and creation.²¹ Israel's failure stemmed from casting ancestral distinctives (e.g., Torah) as identity markers of her "covenant status" ("righteousness") as God's people, thus betraving the covenant's missiological purpose (Gal 2:15f: Rom 9:4-5).²² By construing God's purpose "through-Israel-for-the-world," into "Israel-apart-from-the-world," Israel thus illustrates Martin Luther's description of sin: "turned in on one-self."²³ Wright therefore stresses that "justification" is the "great ecumenical doctrine" of Christian faith; not primarily about "soteriology," but rather, "ecclesiology," proclaiming that in all their diversity, all believers "belong at the same table" (Gal 2:11-16).²⁴ Justification (*dikaiosis*) is thus about God declaring our "status" within His new humanity (Gal 2:15-16; Rom 3:24; 8:30).²⁵ From this social orientation, Wright

Robert P. Menzies (New York, NY; London, UK: T&T Clark International, 2004), 108-109.

²¹N.T. Wright, *What Paul Really Said: Was Paul of Tarsus the Real Founder of Christianity?* (Oxford, UK: Lion Publishing Plc; Sutherland, Australia: Albatross Books Pty Ltd, 1997), 18-19, 32, 84.

²²Wright, What Paul Really Said, 84, 108.

 ²³Wright, Justification: God's Plan and Paul's Vision (London, UK: SPCK, 2009), 215.
²⁴Wright, What Paul Really Said, 119, 122, 158-159.

²⁵Wright, *What Paul Really Said*, 124-125. Wright thus generally renders "righteousness" (*dikaiosynē*; Heb parallel: *tsedaqah elohim*) not as a "moral quality" but as "status" (Gal 2:21; 3:6; Rom 3:20; 4:3; 10:3-4); idem, *Justification*, 100, 113, 187.

describes the "gospel" as God's cosmic victory over all enslaving powers; hence, His "covenant-faithfulness" (Rom 3:21; "righteousness of God;" *dikaiosynē theou*), revealed through the "*faithfulness of*" Christ to this plan (Rom 3:22; *pistis* as subjective genitive, rather than objective genitive: "faith *in*"). ²⁶ The gospel thus summons people to Jesus' Lordship, whereby faith in Him provides justified "status" as God's "new people" who share His cosmic mission.²⁷

Frank Macchia's Trinitarian / Pneumatological Theology of Justification

In his work, Justified in the Spirit: Creation, Redemption, and the Triune God, Macchia develops a "pneumatological theology of justification" informed by Pentecostal accents.²⁸ In doing so, he argues that the "communal reality" of justification implicitly lies at the heart of the pneumatological orientation in Pentecostal spirituality. Macchia moreover discerns this orientation through the tradition's Spirit baptism metaphor, and Lukan-centered hermeneutic.²⁹ The Holy Spirit is the "substance of justification," who "embraces" us, thus justifying us as participants in God's triune life and mission.³⁰ Macchia notes that justification, as a social reality, comprises "profound implications" for "the social witness" of the church as God's justified people.³¹ Yet while Macchia calls notable attention to how the social orientation of justification enjoins our embracing of one another across socially distancing and stratifying boundaries, he only briefly addresses how this trajectory might concretely inform the ecclesiological expression of Pentecostal spirituality.³² This is understandable, however, given that his intended thrust was on explicating an ecumenical theology of justification informed by Pentecostal nuances.³³ I am thus seeking to elucidate directions towards greater ecclesial application of Macchia's work.

²⁶Wright, *What Paul Really Said*, 98-99; idem, *Paul: Fresh Perspectives* (London, UK: SPCK, 2005), 47, 119-120; idem, *Justification*, 178.

²⁷Wright, What Paul Really Said, 109.

²⁸Macchia, *Justified in the Spirit: Creation, Redemption, and the Triune God* (Grand Rapids, MI; Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans, 2010), 14.

 ²⁹Macchia, *Justified in the Spirit*, 14, 30. 37, 188-195. Macchia builds these themes upon his earlier work, *Baptized in the Spirit: A Global Pentecostal Theology* (Grand Rapids, MI: Zondervan, 2006); see ch. 5: "Spirit-Baptized Ecclesiology;" 155-156, 167-168, 174.
³⁰Macchia, *Justified in the Spirit*, 4-5, 8-12, 293-294.

³¹Macchia, Justified in the Spirit, 218.

³²Macchia, Justified in the Spirit, 258, 262, 264, 292.

³³Macchia, Justified in the Spirit, 12-14, 318.

Pentecostal Missional Witness to the Missio Dei

Crucial to missional church thinking is that premises for the mission and life of churches should begin with the *Missio Dei*, God's mission to heal creation from all its fractures (Eph 1:9-10).³⁴ With this in mind, I believe that renewing the Pentecostal vision and witness to God's justice via a strong communal theology of justification suggests a Pentecostal missiology that subsumes ecclesiology and missiology under the *Missio Dei* rubric. Doing so should immediately call to mind the early Pentecostal vision for congregational inclusivism. When socially stratified and ethnically separated people visibly embody union with one another as God's new humanity, they powerfully demonstrate through the power of the Spirit, God's victory over these powers as a foretaste of His coming healing for all creation (Eph 2:14-16; 3:10).³⁵

Over the past decade, Pentecostal theological scholarship has evidenced growing momentum towards a more trinitarian-based, Pentecostal ecclesiology. I suggest that the social orientation of justification will further enhance this momentum.³⁶ We can best further these respective directions by seeing them as intrinsic to one another. They together nurture the maturing of Pentecostalism as a confessional ecclesiological tradition and communally gifted spirituality in manners that ecumenically engage Pentecostal churches and streams to past and present confessional traditions comprising the universal Church. I say this while appreciating Pentecostalism as a prophetic, restorationist and

³⁴A seminal influence is: David J. Bosch, *Transforming Mission: Paradigm Shifts in Theology of Mission* (Maryknoll, NY: Orbis Books, 1991). See: Van Gelder, *The Ministry of the Missional Church*, 15-19, 51-58, 72-88; Alan Roxburgh and M. Scott Boren, *Introducing the Missional Church: What It Is, Why It Matters, How to Become One* (Grand Rapids, MI: Baker Books, 2009), 17-20, 54-55, 68-71, 101-103.

³⁵Wright, *Justification*, 149. My suggestion thus parallels Peter Althouse's earlier proposal for integrating "developments in missional ecclesiology" into Pentecostal ecclesiology: "Towards a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: Participation in the Missional Life of the Triune God," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 18 (2009): 230-245 (230-231). Matthias Wenk meanwhile that a "Pentecostal theology of missions" should reflect the *Missio Dei*, from which he argues for congregational heterogeneity as a missiological aim for Pentecostal churches: "Reconciliation and Renunciation of Status as God's Final Aim for Humanity: New Testament Thoughts on the Church's Mission and Unity," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 19 (2010): 44-58 (45, 56-58).

³⁶On what has been achieved and what remains see: Kärkkäinen, "The Leaning Tower of Pentecostal Ecclesiology': Reflections on the Doctrine of the Church on the Way," in *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology* 267-271.

apostolic oriented type of Christian spirituality.³⁷ Veli-Matti Kärkkäinen thus refers to "restoration of experiential apostolicity."³⁸ A robust Pentecostal ethos mediates restored apostolic vocation and empowerment as worshippers encounter intermediacy into God's inner triune life and pathos via experiences of Spirit baptism.³⁹ These dynamics point to the giftedness of Pentecostal spirituality. Yet to use George Lindbeck's "cultural-linguistic approach," Pentecostal ahistoricism, coupled with ambivalence towards theological reflection, inculcates grassroots Pentecostals towards viewing the Trinity as a cognitive truth-claim with minimal, if any, "regulative" role (*regulae fidei*) on Christian life and ecclesiological ethos.⁴⁰ Renewing the communal implications of justification within Pentecostal tradition should nonetheless prompt and aid us further towards these aims. Justification and "Holiness" in Pentecostal Tradition

The social orientation to justification provides the appropriate theological substantiation for directing ecclesial implications arising from the confession of Jesus as "sanctifier" in the Pentecostal Fivefold Gospel paradigm (Jesus as Savior, Sanctifier, Baptizer, Healer, Coming King, which Matthias Wenk earlier pursued ("The Church as Sanctified Community") at the June 2010 Bangor University (Wales) conference on Pentecostal Ecclesiology. This social orientation thus theologically forwards his argument that the New Testament "ecclesial-inclusiveness" theme provides us the appropriate biblical trajectory for clarifying the Pentecostal confessional connotation of "holiness" in Pentecostal ecclesiology.⁴¹ Wenk insists that the "New Testament vision of a holy community," primarily associates "holiness" not with "personal purity" but rather with "divine acceptance." Divine acceptance in turn leads to an "inclusive ecclesiology." An inclusive ecclesiology thus directs us to the forming of reconciling, socially-

³⁷Land, Pentecostal Spirituality, 3, 6; Macchia, Baptized in the Spirit, 229.

³⁸Kärkkäinen, "Church as Charismatic Fellowship: Ecclesiological Reflections from the Pentecostal-Roman Catholic Dialogue," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 18 (2001): 100-121 (101).

³⁹Land, *Pentecostal Spirituality*, 196-200; Ralph Del Colle, "Spirit-Christology: Dogmatic Foundations for Pentecostal-Charismatic Spirituality," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 3 (1993): 91-112 (106); Peter Hocken, *The Glory and the Shame: Reflections on the 20th Century Outpouring of the Holy Spirit* (Surrey, UK: Eagle; Inter Publishing Service, 1994), 7, 49, 60-61; Macchia, *Baptized in the Spirit*, 63, 258, 271.

 ⁴⁰George A. Lindbeck, *The Nature of Doctrine: Religion and Theology in a Postliberal Age* (Louisville, KT: John Knox Press, 1984), 16-19, 74.
⁴¹Matthias Wenk "The Church as Sanctified Community," in *Toward a Pentecostal*

⁴¹Matthias Wenk "The Church as Sanctified Community," in *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology: The Church and the Fivefold Gospel*, ed. John Christopher Thomas (Cleveland, TN: CPT Press, 2010), 112f, 133-135.

racially embracing communities that visibly challenge normal fragmentations of human society.⁴²

Two particularly relevant biblical themes are first, Jesus' formation of an inclusive community and second, Luke's theology of justification. Wenk notes that Jesus founded a "renewed community characterised by inclusiveness . . . of those formerly marginalised and excluded" in order to renew the true Old Testament nuance on holiness and its corresponding love-ethic (Lev 19:17-18; Isa 2:1-5; 11:1-9; 32:15-20; 65:25).⁴³ To demonstrate the ecclesial significance of the Pentecostal Lukan-centered hermeneutic, Macchia, meanwhile, calls attention to Luke's theology of social justification (e.g., Luke 18:9-14; Acts 13:39). In his early church narratives, Luke thus describes how the Spirit is raising up a justified community, visibly characterised by social inclusiveness (Acts 2:17-18; 42-47)."⁴⁴ Macchia suggests that if we assume that "the Gentile reception of the Spirit" shaped Paul's justification doctrine, then Luke's dual theologies of justification and Spirit baptism provide us the appropriate "narrative framework" for understanding Paul's justification theology.⁴⁵ This trajectory also clarifies Spirit baptism as an "ecclesial dynamic." As such, the Spirit purposes a just community growing in "prophetic empathy for others," which pedagogically begins as congregations welcome diverse peoples into their presence.⁴⁶ Wenk argues that in fidelity to the *Missio Dei*, these themes should direct Pentecostal churches towards fostering social "pluralism" at the congregational level. The formation of such pluralistic churches necessarily calls us to cross horizontal (peer group) and vertical (social strata) stratified social-economic status and ethnic "boundaries," so that we may embody before the world reconciling communities of healing and justice.⁴⁷

⁴²Wenk, "The Church as Sanctified Community," in *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology*, 111-112, 117, 133-135. Wenk thereby addresses the "rigorist . . . exclusivist" congregational ethos that too often has otherwise risen from the Pentecostal holiness emphasis; 111.

⁴³Wenk, "The Church as Sanctified Community," in *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology*, 112-113.

⁴⁴Macchia, Justified in the Spirit, 188, 191, 195.

⁴⁵Macchia, Justified in the Spirit, 195, 218.

⁴⁶Macchia, Baptized in the Spirit, 167-168, 174.

⁴⁷Wenk, "Reconciliation and Renunciation," Journal of Pentecostal Theology, 47-48, 56-58.

The Spirit's Pedagogy for Justice, Charismatic Catholicity, Healing Communities

An important aim of Pentecostal congregational inclusivity should be the fostering of communal catholicity, which endows us as charismatically gifted, healing communities. In a world deeply fractured by ethnicity, age differences and social-economic status, the Spirit displays our social healing and justified status as God's new people before the world and all powers as a proleptic foretaste of His coming healing for all creation. Manifesting and fostering our social healing as God's justified people implore our embracing of "one another" in all our many differences and giftings, at God's table through the fellowship of the Holy Spirit. As pedagogy for justice, the Spirit thus creates opportunities for empowering "one another" to a just fellowship and shared voice within present and emerging expressions of God's shalom.⁴⁸

I suggest that a socially relevant healing community involves our formation into what Miroslav Volf calls, "catholic personalities." These are formed as we engage diverse people; the more comprehensive this engagement to "other Christians past and present, the more catholic" we become. Conversely, failure to embrace "people on the basis of race or social class . . . in their otherness (see Rom 14:1-15:13)," destroys a church's catholicity. Catholicity thus results in giving and receiving of spiritual gifts from one another.⁴⁹ If we presume that the Spirit culturally mediates gifts through our diverse social "callings" (1 Cor 7:17), we thus come into Christian community. as bearers of socially-shaped gifts (*charismata*).⁵⁰ Embracing plurality as a healing community thus endows us with a diversity of gifts and fosters maturity as a charismatic fellowship. Moreover, just as gifts are socially-culturally mediated, so are they socially-economically mediated. When churches grow as inclusive fellowships, there thus arises the moral opportunity to share gifts across social-economic divides.⁵¹

⁴⁸See: Richard J. Mouw, "Life in the Spirit in an Unjust World," *Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies* (Fall 1987): 109-128 (122, 124, 126); Dempster, "Social Concern in the Context of Jesus' Kingdom, Mission and Ministry," *Transformation* 16, no. 2 (1999): 43-53 (52).

⁴⁹Miroslav Volf, *After Our Likeness: The Church as the Image of the Trinity* (Grand Rapids, MI; Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans, 1998), 211-212, 276-278, 281.

⁵⁰Jürgen Moltmann, *The Spirit of Life: A Universal Affirmation*, trans. by Margaret Kohl (Minneapolis, MN: Fortress Press, 2001), 180-182.

⁵¹Mouw, "Life in the Spirit," Pneuma: The Journal of the Society for Pentecostal Studies, 122.

Altogether, the social orientation of justification, the biblical vision of *shalom*, the postmodern turn towards systemic holism and the Pentecostal confession of Jesus as Healer, suggests a socially expansive, systemic perspective on healing.⁵² This suggests all healing is intrinsically social. Hence, the Spirit ultimately links our personal healing to the healing of all relationships. This would include the healing of our relation to those whom we may not yet recognize as integral to our personal healing. Inasmuch as God's reign, manifest in Christian community, fosters healing experiences, these foreshadow cosmic healing. This should therefore prompt us towards practicing God's justice.⁵³ Nicholas Wolterstorff notes that, oftentimes, Evangelical ambivalence towards the idea of practicing justice arises from a misplaced nuance on justice in the "retributive" sense, which arises from a highly privatized and forensically nuanced understanding of salvation. He argues, however, that the "justice" the Spirit prompts us to practice is rather "distributive justice:" insuring the economically vulnerable have enough.⁵⁴

Also relevant is Yong's thesis that global Pentecostalism intrinsically comprises "theological motifs regarding salvific health," which in turn informs prosperity themes within Pentecostalism. Yong argues from the Lukan corpus that proclaiming Jesus as Healer comprises both personal health and "socio-economic peace and justice (shalom)."⁵⁵ Yong thus exhorts us to reflect on how Jesus' Jubilee message (e.g., Isa 61:1-2; Luke 4:18-19), along with early church practices of sharing and mutuality, might guide us towards ecclesial-initiated, "economic practices." This may comprise "solidaristic fellowship" extending particularly to those who are most economically vulnerable, resulting in a "range of informal economic services, guided not by the dominate "economy of exchange," but rather by "a pneumatological economy of grace."

Daniela Augustine has similarly delineated what she calls the "Pentecost communal model." In contrast to current market economy logic, this model finds its pattern in God's giving of creation to

⁵²Opuk Onyinah, "Pentecostal Healing Communities," in *Toward a Pentecostal Ecclesiology*, 208, 218-219.

⁵³Cornelius A. Buller, "Healing Hope: Physical Healing and Resurrection Hope in a Postmodern Context," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 10, no. 2 (2002): 74-92 (88, 90-91).

⁵⁴Nicholas Wolterstorff, "Why Care about Justice?" in *Hearing the Call: Liturgy, Justice, Church, and the World* (Grand Rapids, MI; Cambridge, UK: William B. Eerdmans, 2011), 95-97.

⁵⁵Yong, In the Days of Caesar, 257-258, 263-265, 269, 295.

⁵⁶Yong, In the Days of Caesar, 305-306.

humanity. God's gift "does not follow market logic," however, for creation "is not compensated for its contribution." God gives creation for the "pedagogical" aim of teaching humanity to "share it with the other and the different." In this manner, humanity grows "in the likeness of God."⁵⁷ Augustine then points to the Pentecost event as a paradigm illustrating the Jubilee economic practice of "distributive justice" (Acts 4:32-35). Growing in this pedagogical discipline and economic practice of "sharing" wealth, which moreover involves a practice of "reverent consumption," thus embodies healing within the Christian community as a foretaste of God's healing for all creation.⁵⁸

Conclusion

I have argued that informing Pentecostal tradition with a stronger social orientation of justification will significantly help renew, in manners highly relevant to our early 21st century market and consumerist-driven world order, the Pentecostal vision and witness of the justified people of God. I believe this infers an ecclesial witness, which unites social-economic, generational, and ethnically stratified peoples, into heterogeneous missional communities. In this manner, we prophetically witness to God's reign as visibly proleptic signs to His healing for all creation. Becoming a healing community thus results from maturing as a socially charismatic community that is full of ever increasing gifts, which the Holy Spirit pours out through our receiving and giving to one another. The Holy Spirit gives us these gifts, by giving in our diversity, ourselves to one another. In so doing, the Spirit raises up an inclusive fellowship in the likeness of the triune God. The Pentecostal missional church recognizes that, oftentimes, there are difficult obstacles, which limit our inclusiveness, such as in the case of targeted outreach to a people group whose primary language severely restricts their participation within the greater congregation. Yet, even still, we can maintain a sustained vision and strategic actions for growth as socially inclusive fellowships of the Holy Spirit.

In a world crying for justice, Pentecostal healing communities must grow in the spiritual practice of hospitality. Christian healing thus comprises embracing the "other," those who are significantly different from us, into our lives and living space. Such hospitality displays us as a healing people, dramatizing a lived contrast to a very inhospitable

⁵⁷Daniela C. Augustine, "Pentecost Communal Economics and the Household of God," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology* 19 (2010): 219-242 (224-225).

⁵⁸Augustine, "Pentecost Communal Economics," *Journal of Pentecostal Theology*, 233-236.

world. In doing so, God empowers the weak and marginalized to dream a better future for the world and meaningfully contribute to its coming fullness. I believe that Pentecostal experiences of Spirit baptism grant entry into a new world order, wherein the "last" receive an empowering grace to become the "first." In this new order of life, the Spirit grants both the "first" and the "last," the affluent and not affluent, the marginalized voice and the majority voice, a common tongue signifying the inclusive broadness of God's eschatological "household" (*oikoumene*). As this happens, the world identifies us as communities more visibly sensitized to the socially marginalized, than to the socially affluent, powerful, privileged, elite, and secure, even as the Spirit unites people of every social strata and background into one community of love.

We live in a world thirsting for living water, and it thirsts for communities who can offer this water without cost, other than the cost of learning how to receive and give ourselves to one another. For such a time as this, such communities grow in their healing as an inclusive people. Such a people recognize that in receiving the "different" and the many we rise up as charismatically powerful people of destiny. We rise up together, laboring with God through the power of His Spirit, and dramatizing through our union as God's new people the coming new world of Perfect Love.